

**BRAIN DRAIN, EXODUS AND CHICKEN RUN:
MEDIA DISCOURSES ON EMIGRATION**

A journal article thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of

MASTERS IN PSYCHOLOGY (COUNSELLING)

of

RHODES UNIVERSITY

by

SUE-ANN BRIGHT

February 2004

**BRAIN DRAIN, EXODUS AND CHICKEN RUN:
MEDIA DISCOURSES ON EMIGRATION**

SUE-ANN BRIGHT

Department of Psychology, Rhodes University, East London, South Africa.

ABSTRACT

This paper explores the discourses of emigration in a South African daily newspaper from 1988 to 2001, and discusses the implications of these discourses on the way in which emigration is constructed within South African society. In this paper, Potter and Wetherell's (1987) approach to discourse analysis is utilized. It makes use of interpretative repertoires, to explore the functions and consequences of the discourses. The discursive framework thereby reveals the different subject positions related to nationalism, race and class. It is argued that economics and notions of culture and social class, do more than provide a useful medium through which the phenomenon of emigration can be understood. They also support the affirmations of certain groups of people above others, by claiming that emigration is unpatriotic and disloyal. This paper concludes by identifying the negative connotations of media discourses in the construction of emigration and acknowledges that many alternate constructions are silenced in this matter.

TABLE OF CONTENT

	Preface	i.
1.	Introduction	1.
2.	Literature Review	2.
2.1	Social Construction	2.
2.1.1	Self and Social Identity	3.
2.1.2	The Social Construction of the Nation and Nationalism	5.
2.2	The Role of the Mass Media	7.
2.3	Emigration	10.
3.	Methodology	15.
3.1	Social Construction	15.
3.2	Discourse Analysis	15.
3.3	Interpretative Repertoires	17.
3.4	Method	17.
4.	The Context of Discourse	22.
5.	Analysis	26.
6.	Discussion	27.
6.1	The Brain Drain – Discourses of Economics	27.
6.2	Exodus – Discourses of Nationalism and Race	33.
6.2.1	Nationalism	33.
6.2.2	Race	39.
6.3	Chicken Run – Discourses of Rationalism	42.

7.	Conclusion	47.
	Reference List	49.
	Appendix I – Articles from which extracts are taken	
	Appendix II – Headlines	

Preface

As per departmental requirements, this thesis has been formatted as a journal article. The journal selected for this purpose is *Discourse & Society*. Their editorial guidelines are as follows:

- typed double spaced throughout on one side of A4 paper
- recommended length of 7000 words, including footnotes and references with an abstract of up to 150 words and up to 10 key words
- lengthy quotations (over 40 words) should be displayed, indented, in the text
- references cited in the text should read: Brown (1987: 63-4), Brown and Smith (1984, 1989). Use 'et. al.' For more than two authors
- all text references should be listed alphabetically after the notes as follows: Books: Wodak, R. (1996) *Disorders of Discourse*. London: Longman. Articles: Martin Rojo, J. and Van Dijk, T.A. (1997) "There was a Problem and It was Solved!": Legitimizing the Expulsion of "Illegal" Migrants in Spanish Parliamentary Discourse'. *Discourse & Society* 8(4): 523-66.

As this thesis is for academic purposes, it complies with all of the Discourse & Society requirements, except for the recommended maximum length.

1. Introduction

Many South Africans have been affected by emigration, and it is a focal area of discussion for some. This makes emigration a newsworthy phenomenon. Emigration impacts upon individuals, family structures and society and as such it is deemed an important topic of investigation for social psychology.

The focus of this research is to unpack the surface appearance of the constructions of emigration as formulated by the mass media, thereby revealing the meta-structures – the discourses (Neuman, 1991). Revealing these discourses is significant because “humans define and create their own experiences, but the situations in which experiences occur, and the meanings of those experiences, are often given in advance by the social, cultural, political, and economic institutions of society” (Lindesmith, Strauss & Denzin, 1999: 5). Hence, explication of these discourses allows for an improved understanding of social life and social interaction (Potter and Wetherell, 1987).

The epistemological position of this research is social constructionism and it is contended that the constructions of emigration by mass media are purposeful and functional. The essence of this investigation, therefore, is a discourse analysis of sixty articles published in a South African newspaper, in which reference is made to emigration. This analysis allows for dominant discourses to become apparent, and for the explication of those discourses, with regard to the constructions of emigration.

2. Literature Review

Emigration is a global phenomenon, the effects thereof far reaching for the individuals as well as societies. However, the purpose of this study is to determine how the South African mass media has constructed emigration, therefore, the area of analysis will be confined to the South African context.

Three topics, namely social construction, mass media and emigration will now be introduced, thereby illustrating their interconnectedness and significance to this research.

2.1 Social construction

Social constructionism challenges empirical ideas of, and claims to, truth, knowledge, objectivity and insight by acknowledging that these are founded within meaning making communities (Gergen, 2001). Therefore, central to constructionism is that human experience, perceptions, and indeed subjectivity, are negotiated historically, culturally and linguistically (Willig, 2001).

A further premise is that “social objects are not given ‘in the world’ but constructed, negotiated, reformed, fashioned, and organised by human beings in their effort to make sense of happenings in the world” (Sarbin and Kitsuse, 1995: 3). Although human beings process information, the processing is conveyed in the context of cultural practices and purposes (Sarbin and Kitsuse, 1995); accordingly the way that an individual interprets their world is a construction. It can therefore be reasoned that human beings, through various tools, such as language, interpret and understand the context of their world.

Language has been identified as an important aspect of construction, since it is through language that different knowledges can be forged (Willig, 2001).

Since emigration has implications for the constructions of self and social identity, as well as nation and nationalism, it is deemed important to be theoretically aware of these concepts.

2.1.1 Self and Social Identity

In understanding the development of identity, social psychologists differentiate between the terms self and identity. Self is often used to describe humans as “reflexive, language-using beings” (Lindesmith, et. al., 1999: 218). The term identity, on the other hand, is used to differentiate people from each other and to “refer to the interpretive meanings brought to these differences” (Lindesmith, et. al., 1999: 218).

Within constructionism, it is argued that the way people experience the world and the people they experience themselves to be, are primarily the results of social processes. These processes reproduce and transform social structures of meanings, practices, morals and discourses which inform relationships between people and the relationship they have with themselves (Nightingale and Cromby, 1999). Therefore, an individual processes socially constructed information regarding their identity, their understanding of their self and identity and their interactions with others through socially constructed cultural practices and purposes. This research is rooted in social constructionism, but in understanding self and identity, there is compatibility between social constructionism and

social identity theory. It becomes evident then, that language is central because it is the provider of instruction for activity, and it is through language that we experience categories and meanings (Nightingale and Cromby, 1999).

Drawing on the above-mentioned ideas, it becomes apparent that social identity “derives from our knowledge of our membership of social groups and the meanings that such memberships have for us” (Reicher and Hopkins, 2001: 33). Social identity theory underscores that “social identities are defined in terms of difference from one another” and thus “social identification necessarily involves social comparison” (Reicher and Hopkins, 2001: 33). However, it is stressed that “differentiation occurs on *valued dimensions of comparison*” meaning “what is valued depends on the specific category that one is dealing with” and that “it is a function of cultural and not psychological factors” (Reicher and Hopkins, 2001: 34). This is an important statement in relation to this research, since “the behavioural consequence of that process [differentiation] depend upon the cultural parametres that feed into it” (Reicher and Hopkins, 2001: 34). Cultural practices and the meanings thereof are therefore of the utmost importance to the understanding and experiencing of one’s self and identity.

2.1.2 The social construction of the nation and nationalism

‘Nation’ and nationalism have been viewed through the disciplinary lenses of political science, sociology and anthropology (e.g. Hylland Eriksen, 1993), but now a more social constructionism perspective is being brought to bear (e.g. Billig, 1995). This research

will analyse the constructions formulated by the mass media and will therefore focus, in particular, on its constructions of nation and nationalism.

A nation can be defined as having objective characteristics, such as a territory, a language, a religion, or common descent, and subjective characteristics, which are essentially people's awareness of their nationality and their loyalty to it (Kellas, 1998). These subjective characteristics gain meaning through social processes and are identified through language, metaphors and symbols.

Billig (1997) says "when groups declare themselves to be national groups, they are making particular political statements, evoking an ideological history of entitlement and rights" (1997: 50). He goes on further to explicate nationalism as "both an ideology and a form of behaviour. The ideology of nationalism builds on people's awareness of a nation to give a set of attitudes and a programme of action. These may be cultural, economic or political" (1997: 4). Therefore, although nation contains objective characteristics, both nation and nationalism are cultural processes, which are socially constructed. An ideology can be explained as comprising

the ways of thinking and behaving within a given society, which make the ways of that society, seem 'natural' or unquestioned to its members. In this way, ideology is the common sense of the society. Through ideology, the inequalities of that society will appear as 'natural' or 'inevitable' (Billig, 1997: 48).

Thus, an ideology is shared through language and has implicit and explicit implications in how a person 'experiences' their own nation and sense of nationalism and how they

understand that of others. This is considered significant to this research, as ideology and nationalism are both constructed socially, within specific cultural parameters, thereby creating particular discernment of context, and therefore, both have relevance in the understanding of constructs of emigration, specifically within the South African context.

Both immigration and emigration will impact on the way people experience and attach meaning to nation and nationalism. A study focusing on media discourse on immigration in Italy, revealed that

the press discourse re-defines the cultural and territorial foundations of the nation in an exclusionary manner suggesting that immigrants must remain outside the national community because they pose a threat to the cultural authenticity of the nation. Fears are expressed in the press that the contact with alien cultures may blur the distinctiveness of the Italian lifestyle and threaten the people's sense of identity (Triandafyllidou, 1999: 11).

As the discussion above suggests, language, discourses and meaning are vital sources for the understanding of self and self in relation to others, including the nation. As Billig writes, "the social psychological study of identity should involve the detailed study of discourse" (1995: 8). With reference to the interconnectedness between social construction and the mass media, the mass media is considered an important tool used in the production and reproduction of social processes and that this relationship is reciprocal.

2.2 The role of the mass media

The mass media is one of the primary means through which people gain much of their information about the world (Thomas and Wareing, 2000). Media can be surveyed as “part of a wider apparatus, reproducing and producing, through particular organisation of signs embodied within the media text, wider cultural values and beliefs” (Blackman and Walkerdine 2001: 20). It is therefore postulated that mass media are contributory tools used in the construction and dissemination of social meanings (Thomas and Wareing, 2000).

It has been argued that what the media expresses acts upon our emotions and reason (Street, 2001). Furthermore, “however media texts are understood, their content matters because it is assumed that we believe what we see or read and that, in believing it, we change the way we think or act” (Street, 2001: 4). Additional research has revealed that communications media make increasing demands on our time, help to define our patterns of leisure, and play a role in our social lives. These media often present us with overwhelming amounts of information and images, about ourselves and about other people. They serve to define what is of political concern, of economic importance, of cultural interest to us (Downing, Mohammadi and Sreberny-Mohammadi, 1995: xvi).

The mass media therefore serves to perpetuate the ideas of nation and nationalism. It can be argued that human understanding of self and the world are socially constructed, in part through language and the mass media. Common sense and ideology are created and

upheld by social beings and social beings are created and upheld by common sense and ideology (Billig, 1995). However, it is also understood that this is not a stable or fixed state, but rather that it is a dynamic and fluid changing state. Triandafyllidou (1999) postulated that

the press discourse sets, at least to a certain extent, the boundaries of the cognitive, ideological and normative universe within which individuals form, express and discuss their opinions. It also offers the tools, information, symbols and metaphors, for the individuals to develop their own beliefs and attitudes (1999: 11).

Press discourses offer a particular set of representations and interpretations. Dixon, Foster, Durrheim and Wilbraham (1994) distinguish between realist-empiricist discourse and romanticist discourse. According to these authors, “realist discourse attempt to pass itself off as a faithful reflection of the world and to deny its status as a mere construction of truth” (1994: 285). Realist-empiricist discourse makes use of realist composition and “excludes linguistic forms or contents that impede the efficient transmission of information or undercut its illusory transparency” (Dixon, et. al., 1994: 286).

Romanticist discourse, on the other hand, is the opposite because language tends to be more lyrical, personal and privileges the subjective. As the focus of this research is the media, in particular the print media, it is necessary to understand the concepts of truth and reality in relation to social constructionism. Reality, and the meaning thereof, can be summarised as being threefold; namely in relation to falsehood and truth, as determining what is true and what is not; illusion and materiality, as to what really exists, such as a

table, and what is fantasy; and construction and essence, as to what is real and what is merely constructed (Parker, 1998). Truth is considered to be a support for moral, ethical, economic, religious, artistic choices in that it necessitates or justifies advocacy for one world view over another, implying a legitimating function (Parker, 1998). Therefore, as can be expected, the media is presumed to be realistic, objective and true, by drawing on realist-empiricist discourse, and by making use of various strategies and devices to claim its authenticity. Such strategies include the use of statistical evidence, direct quotations and relatively unemotive, objective language. Direct quotations implicate “an expert who, although exterior to the text is present within it as guarantor of its accuracy” (Dixon, et. al., 1994:285).

Texts are inherently rhetoric in nature. The role of rhetoric is to persuade and is therefore argumentative, and “our accounts are always located within a context of public debate and argument” (Burr, 1995: 165). With respect to this research, it was found that emigration is a prominent and hotly debated topic among some South Africans. In this context, the rhetorical aspects of language are therefore deemed important as “accounts are simultaneously arguing for one position and against other positions, although what is being rejected may not be explicitly stated in the account” (Burr, 1995: 166). Hence in the analysis which follows, attention is given not only to what is being said, but also to what is being rejected (Burr, 1995), and to “patterns of ideology, for it [rhetoric] can reveal what is being taken for granted as common sense” (Billig, 1997:51).

The above discussion reveals that the mass media has a powerful voice. This voice directs how human beings construct their world, their awareness of their roles and their ideologies. This voice of the mass media can take on various truths and positions, and can extend to almost all human subjectivities. One such subjective human practice is that of emigration.

2.3 Emigration

For the purpose of this research, it is important to differentiate between internal migration and international migration. Internal migration refers to “changes of residence between origins and destinations that are located within the same territorial boundary” (Stillwell and Congdon, 1991: 3). International migration however, is a movement to a foreign country or the crossing of a territorial boundary. Migration is not a new phenomenon in South Africa. Historically, European immigrants settled in South Africa and the indigenous populations migrated (either voluntarily or forcefully) to and from various parts of the country.

Migration has frequently been viewed simply as the outcome of personal decisions made by individuals (Mostert, Hofmeyr, Oosthuizen and van Zyl, 1998). Although the capacity of these personal decisions must not be ignored in the understanding of migration, it is proposed that these decisions are ‘proximate’ or direct causes of migration. Several ‘non-proximate’ or indirect causes have been identified, such as social, economic, cultural and ecological factors (Mostert, et. al., 1998). Demographers argue that the non-proximate causes work through the proximate causes and thereby become the ‘real’ motive for

migration. Age, gender, ethnicity, educational qualifications and occupation have been identified as non-proximate factors which need to be considered (Mostert, et. al., 1998). These factors may make the possibility of emigration more or less accessible due to economic mobility, demand and migratory laws. Lee (1966, cited by Mostert, et. al., 1998), postulated that

migration is caused by the strength of the positive and negative forces that have an influence on migrants' place of origin and place of destination, and on themselves as well as their families. There are – in the place of origin as well as the place of destination – three kinds of forces that influence decisions on migration, namely negative forces in the place of origin (push factors), positive forces in the place of destination (pull factors) and obstacles between place of origin and place of destination. The obstacles can be regarded as the 'costs' of migration and neutralise push factors as well as pull factors. However, the push factors and the pull factors themselves are sometimes based on subjective perceptions of social, political and economic circumstances, rather than on objective judgements of these circumstances (Mostert, et. al., 1998: 173).

This then suggests that there is an interface between the 'proximate' and 'non-proximate' causes, together with these other social and psychological factors, which motivate decision to emigrate. Finally, it is important to signpost that there are definitional difficulties inherent in emigration. For instance emigration is dependent on émigrés self declaration, hence figures unavoidably preclude "citizens who leave permanently under the pretext of temporary visits" (Forgey, et. al., 2000: 21).

The impact of emigration within the developing world has been widely researched (e.g. Crush, 2002). Outward Bound (cited in *The Economist*, September 9, 2002: 30) questioned whether “developing countries gain or lose when their brightest talents go abroad?” (2002: 30). It was reported that “migrating, legally or illegally, is expensive. So a higher proportion of the well-educated can afford to emigrate than of the poor” (*The Economist*, September 9, 2002: 30). This implies that the more mobile (economically) are more likely to have the opportunities to emigrate. However, the argument follows that the “loss of skilled and educated may do more harm than emigration in general” because “their departure removes the stabilising political influence of a middle class” and possibly “the exodus of scientists and academics wreaks particular havoc, especially if it happens quickly” (*The Economist*, September 9, 2002: 31).

Of particular interest to this social constructionistic study is the language and discourses used with reference to the construction of emigration. Media, researchers, academics and ordinary men and women often use words and metaphors such as ‘exodus’, ‘chicken run’ and ‘brain drain’ (e.g. Polonsky, Scott and Suchard, 1988; Horowitz and Kaplan, 2001; Crush, 2002; Daily Dispatch 1988).

Polonsky, Scott and Suchard, quote Oteiza’s (1968) definition of a brain drain as “a significantly large movement from one country to various countries of persons having a high degree of education, mostly obtained in the formal educational systems of a country prior to the last migration” (1988: 1293). The metaphor, brain drain, therefore points to the fact that it is the more economically mobile persons who emigrate as their skills are in

demand in other countries. An article entitled “Losing the best and the brightest” stated that “nearly a quarter of the doctors working in Canada are international graduates, trained abroad. About 1 900 of them come from South Africa, which is the source of similar numbers of doctors working in New Zealand, Australia, and Britain” (2002: 30). However, an argument has been advanced that “one country’s gain isn’t necessarily another country’s loss. A recent study by the Brookings Institute in the U.S., sees the movement of labour as brain circulation rather than brain drain” (2002: 30) because “professional and social networks create a two-way exchange of knowledge and wealth that become global institutions” (2002: 31). Similar ideas can be observed within the South African context through contract work abroad.

Crush (2002) has linked this metaphor of brain drain with another, that of ‘global raiders’. He states that “the South African government has suggested that the movement of health professionals to other countries is primarily the result of organised skills raiding by other countries” (2002: 56). In response to this, new South African immigration legislation hopes to concentrate on and assist in bringing in skills from abroad (Crush, 2002). Globally, it has been found that obtaining skills from outside the country is a significant way of making up for domestic training and experience shortfalls caused by brain drains and (less applicably to South Africa), the growth of an ageing population (Crush, 2002).

Emigration also has religious and cultural aspects. Horowitz and Kaplan (2001) focused on Jewish emigration from South Africa. The title of their article is “The Jewish Exodus

from the New South Africa” and is important to this research, because it’s discourses draws the reader into a particular construct. This religious discourse may be appropriate because the focal point of the research is that of the migration of Jewish citizens from South Africa. This discourse may be considered interesting because the reasons for the ‘exodus’ are not religious persecution or religious opportunities, but rather “fear of political instability and political violence, deteriorating economic conditions and prospects, fear of directly discriminatory government policies, rising violent crime rates, and more permissive immigration policies in desirable destination countries” (Horowitz and Kaplan, 2001: 1). Crush also refers to the biblical discourse of exodus: “the collapse of the Apartheid system in the 1980’s sparked a (primarily White) exodus from South Africa” (2002: 2). He qualifies this statement by saying “some of these emigrants are self-styled ‘refugees from democracy’ (privileged Whites who, rather than contemplate the redistribution of privilege, have decided to leave for other shores)” (2002: 2).

It becomes clear that emigration is often based on economic considerations, but that the discourses and metaphors of emigration may attribute alternative understandings of the phenomenon. The mere fact that the words of Crush (2002) and others (e.g., Horowitz and Kaplan, 2001) use, may be perceived to have negative connotations, suggests that language practices related to emigration influence the meanings that the South African population may attribute to this form of migration.

3. Methodology

3.1 Social Construction

As already stated, social constructionism focuses on the construction, and textual deconstruction of that construction within the social world. Therefore, a useful key to unlocking the social world is language. One such tool in opening up constructions within language, is that of discourse analysis.

3.2 Discourse Analysis

Burr (1995: 49) describes discourses as “a set of meanings, metaphors, representations, images, stories, statements and so on that in some way together produce a particular version of reality”. Furthermore, there is a dual nature to discourses: “they are the means through which the world emerges and action becomes possible, but they also constrain which meanings or knowledges become dominant” (Strebel, 1997: 111). Therefore, issues of truth, power and knowledge need to be recognized. Truth is hence produced within societies through human interaction, rather than a concept which intuitively emerges (Mills, 1997). With reference to power and the nature of a discourse, Strebel states that

at different times, for different reasons, some versions of social reality are deemed legitimate, ‘given a voice’ and reside in the hands of ‘experts’, while others are silenced. In this way power relations are produced and reproduced through ideological systems (1997: 111).

Knowledge is seen as linked with power, since it is ultimately a result or effect of power struggles (Mills, 1997).

The goal of discourse analysis then is “to make a contribution to our understanding of issues of identity, the nature of mind, constructions of self, other and the world and the conceptualization of social action and interaction” (Potter and Wetherell, 1995: 81). Accordingly, discourse analysis is “concerned with how discourse is constructed to perform social actions...” (Potter and Wetherell, 1995: 81).

There is much debate about how to define discourse, text and discourse analysis due to the various positions of the different schools of discourse analytic thought. Within the field of social psychology, there are varied understandings of discourse analysis, such as critical discourse analysis, a social psychological orientated discourse analysis and conversational analysis (Wood and Kroger, 2000). However, for the purpose of this research, the discourse analytic approach drawn on is,

essentially a theoretical orientation in which versions of mind and reality, including event reports, are explicable in terms of principles of report construction, as situated discursive action, prior to any status they may have as clues to the nature of the world, or to the workings of mind. Specific versions of events (and other things) are seen as socially produced outcomes, or accomplishments, of discourse, rather than as neutral inputs to psychological processes, or as cognitive states that versions reveal (Edwards, Potter and Middleton, 1992: 443).

This research has adopted the understanding of discourse analysis as outlined by Potter and Wetherell (1987) and utilises their notion of interpretative repertoires.

3.3 Interpretative Repertoires

Potter and Wetherell have defined interpretative repertoires as “discernable clusters of terms, descriptions and figures of speech often assembled around metaphors or vivid images” (1995: 89). Interpretative repertoires are considered important because they allow for “understanding the content of discourse and how that content is organised” (Potter and Wetherell, 1995: 89). Interpretative repertoires, therefore, form a particular goal of the analysis of discourse, to accentuate human agency. The focus of this research is to understand the mass media’s construction of emigration, where issues of individual independence and power are closely linked to issues of identity and nationalism.

3.4 Method

Potter and Wetherell outlined a ten-stage method for discourse analysis (Potter and Wetherell, 1987; Wood and Kroger, 2000). The first stage deals with the research question. The question of this research is focused on how discourses are put together, and what is accomplished by this construction, which gives primacy to discourse articulated in the South African mass media, and examines the function and consequence of these constructions (Wood and Kroger, 2000).

The second stage is the sample selection. Potter and Wetherell state that

because one is interested in language use rather than the people generating the language and because a large number of linguistic patterns are likely to emerge from a few people, small samples ... are generally quite adequate for investigating an interesting and practically important range of phenomena (1987: 161).

This then implies that the fruition of a study is not subject to the sample size, and that the sample size is determined by the specific research question (Potter and Wetherell, 1987). For the purpose of this research, the criterion for sample selection was the use of the word emigration within newspaper articles. Due to discourse analysis being a constructionistic methodology, rigidly modernistic conceptions of validity and reliability were rejected (Wood and Kroger, 2000). Reliability informs researchers about the dependability and consistency of an indication, whereas validity refers to whether an indicator captures the meaning of the construct which is being researched (Neuman, 1997). However, neither of these scientific measures are appropriate for this study. Therefore, instead of seeking dependability and fit, the researcher is rather interested in the function, construction and variation of discourse, implying that people use language to do things, construct versions of the social world and that language use is variable (Potter and Wetherell, 1987; Edwards, et. al., 1992; Wood and Kroger, 2000). Accordingly, the sample selected was not based on traditional ideas of validity and reliability, but rather driven by concerns of explicating the complexity of constructions of emigration, as “the value or generalisability of results depends on the reader assessing the importance and interest of the effect described and deciding whether it has vital

consequences for the area of social life in which it emerges and possibly for other diverse areas” (Potter and Wetherell, 1987: 161).

The third stage deals with the collection of records and documents. The researcher acquired the articles from the archives of the Daily Dispatch in East London. The articles were published in this newspaper between 1988 and 2001 and are a matter of public record.

The fourth stage, as outlined by Potter and Wetherell, is that of the interviews. This stage is inapplicable to this research, as the researcher has limited the analysis to the articles only. This does not negatively impact on the quality of the findings, as live subjects and subjectivity are not a methodological prerequisite for discourse analysis (Wood and Kroger, 2000).

The fifth stage is transcription. As described by Potter and Wetherell “a good transcript is essential for a form of analysis which involves repeated readings of sections of data” ... “and the process of transcription itself can be helpful in forcing the transcriber to closely read a body of discourse” (1987: 165). Although issues of timing and intonations are of importance when analysing a transcribed verbal text, the focus of this research is on written texts, rendering these issues of less concern. Consequently, transcription was necessary only to alter the format, thereby making the articles more reader-friendly.

The sixth stage entails coding. According to Potter and Wetherell, the goal of coding “is not to find results but to squeeze an unwieldy body of discourse into manageable chunks. It is an analytic preliminary preparing the way for a much more intensive study of the material culled through the selective coding process” (1987: 167). In the practical application of coding, the researcher began by reading and re-reading the transcripts of the article, in chronological order, which allowed for the researcher to become familiar with all of the material. Numerous copies of the transcripts were then made, thereby allowing the researcher opportunity to create multiple combinations of articles by placing and reading them within different associations. Through the coding of all sixty articles, themes emerged. The criteria for the themes were derived from the concepts of social identity and nationalism, where terms, phrases or metaphors for these concepts were apparent. Press discourses, such as realist-empiricist discourse and rhetoric, allowed for certain strategies and devices to be identified in the text. The themes allowed for certain tropes (metaphors, emotive language, and reference to gender issues, racial issues, political issues) to be established and dominant discourses to be made apparent, thereby allowing the researcher to select the ten articles that would be used to illustrate this research.

The seventh stage is the analysis. Within the analysis stage there are two sub-stages that are closely linked. Potter and Wetherell explain:

first, there is the search for patterns in the data. This pattern will be in the form of both variability: *differences* in either the content or form of accounts, and consistency: the identification of features shared by accounts. Second, there is the

concern with function and consequence. The basic theoretical thrust of discourse analysis is the argument that people's talk fulfils many functions and has varying effects. The second phase of analysis consists of forming hypotheses about these functions and effects and searching for the linguistic evidence (1987: 198).

The coding process exposed patterns, which then allowed for the variability and consistency of the narratives to become visible. Reading and re-reading the articles allowed for the formulation of hypotheses about the functions and consequences of the arguments, and linguistic evidence within the articles was sought to substantiate them. It was then that strategies adopted from critical discourse analysis became useful, in understanding the context of racial issues, and related to those, issues of power.

The eighth stage, as identified by Potter and Wetherell (1987) is validation. Validation can be determined through the use of several techniques, namely coherence, participants' orientation, new problems and fruitfulness. "These four techniques for validating the findings of discourse analysis allow for stringent examination of any claims" (Potter and Wetherell, 1987:172). Assessing the coherence, allowed the researcher to corroborate the effects and functions of the discursive structure, by examining the exceptions to the patterns identified. However, understanding the participant's orientation proved to be an arduous task as the research did not have access to the participants. Therefore the texts themselves served as participants and guided the investigation of confirmation by highlighting consistency and difference. In uncovering the dominant discourses and appraising their functions and consequences, new problems were exposed, providing additional validation that linguistic resources were being used, as postulated (Potter and



Wetherell, 1987). During the analysis, discourses that were revealed informed the development of an analytic scheme, which then generated novel explanations (Potter and Wetherell, 1987).

The ninth stage involves the reporting of research findings. The aim is to present analysis and conclusions in such a way that the reader is able to review the researcher's interpretations (Potter and Wetherell, 1987).

The final stage, outlined by Potter and Wetherell is that of application. They say that "one of the positive fruits of discourse analysis is to promote an informed critical attitude to discourse" (Potter and Wetherell, 1987: 175). This then means being "more aware of its constructive nature and the close connection between the way the textual versions of the world are put together and specific policies and evaluations are pushed" (Potter and Wetherell, 1987: 175). There are various ways for application to take place. One possibility is to begin a process of dialogue with those who have been researched, thereby promoting active and critical involvement. A second possibility, more suited to this research is popularization, a process of the giving away the information revealed by the analysis freely (Potter and Wetherell, 1987).

4. The context of discourse

The South African context must be highlighted, as discourses do not exist in a void, but are rather contextually bound. Although issues of racial dominance and segregation were evident prior to the Nationalist government and the formal institution of Apartheid, the

focus of this research is on the last decades of Apartheid and the first decade of a politically reformed South Africa (Worden, 1994).

The emergence of South Africa as an independent nation state occurred less than half a century ago, although this emergence was preceded by the colonisation of Southern Africa. History reflects that this time of White conquest was not stable or even certain, but was characterized by “setbacks, uneven population movements and uncertain goals” (Worden, 1994: 5). However, as it progressed, “a unified and distinctively capitalist nation had come into being which was an integral part of the British Empire, was ruled by Whites and had firmly entrenched colonial and settler interests” (Worden, 1994: 5).

The ideology of racial superiority was not unique to South Africa; its roots, although complex, can be uncovered in the course of European colonialism, which subjugated indigenous people through a process of territorial conquest. However, in South Africa it developed into Apartheid, which was a methodical and official discrimination encompassing the economic, social and political structure of the whole country (Butler, 1998; Koelble, 1998). The bedrock of Apartheid was the separation of all South Africans by race, and the underlying principle of this segregation was the “enforced separation, not just subordination, of Blacks and Whites in the spheres of work, residence and government” (Worden, 1994: 72).

Apartheid was received with mounting opposition, both domestically and internationally. The national liberation movements became more organised and entered into an armed

struggle in response to mounting state repression (Butler, 1998). During the 1970's, South Africa experienced violence and turmoil. Political uprisings and ethnic clashes resulted in the Government declaring several states of emergency, particularly in the 1980's (Moss and Obery, 1987). Furthermore attempts were made by the increasingly militaristic Apartheid government to destabilise the frontline states, such as Angola and Mozambique (Worden, 1994).

By the 1980's, internal and external opposition reached its zenith. This combined with an increasingly untenable economic situation saw the Apartheid State liberalise the political climate and enter into negotiations. On the second of February 1990, Nelson Mandela's release from prison was announced. Political negotiations saw the first democratic election and Nelson Mandela was elected as the first Black president of South Africa (Worden, 1994).

In response to the widespread social and political changes, the people of South Africa formed a new national identity. South African identity dynamics are too complex to delineate in detail, but for the purposes of this research the nationalism and national identity of Afrikaans and English speaking South Africans will be explored. Afrikaner nationalism is well theorised. Butler says that the "most contemporary analysis views Afrikaner nationalism as a response to the social dislocation that came with industrialization and the modernization of the state" (1998: 32), particularly from the period of Union, as a British dominion. However, Afrikaner nationalism also drew on theological discourses, notably the Calvinistic religious observances of the Dutch

Reformed Church (Butler, 1998). The White English speaking South African's national identity is less well theorized, and this group formed a less cohesive national identity. However, many White English-speakers became associated with liberalism, "with its benign recognition of the dignity of every culture, and its franchise operating according to property rather than race" (Butler, 1998: 39). Particularly for the first half of the twentieth century, they occupied prominent positions in the private sector and in relation to capital. The twentieth century history of South Africa is therefore, to some extent, the story of how various group's national and ethnic identity was prescribed and shaped by their socio-economic class (Worden, 1994).

The change from Apartheid to democracy had important consequences for the nation. As the world became a global village, democracy, as a political system, evolved, becoming a more market driven permutation (Koelble, 1998). Democracy, by the early twentieth first century has become

part of an encompassing ideological and practical global configuration. This configuration involves a commitment to capitalist modes of production, a largely Western construction of a set of values or norms concerning the rights of individuals, and a neoliberal position on the role of the state vis-à-vis the individual and the economy (Koelble, 1998: 2).

From this definition, it is clear that modern day democracy prescribes a certain ideology and it has been argued that "economic conditions are an important determinant of the success of democratic transformations" (Koelble, 1998: 15). The implications of this

understanding of democracy are meaningful to this research, since material and economic relations play an important role in the construction of emigration.

5. Analysis

The Daily Dispatch is an English medium daily morning newspaper published in East London and services the Border region of the Eastern Cape, which includes the former so-called independent states of the Transkei and Ciskei. During the politically turbulent 1970's and 1980's, 30 per cent of its readership lived in these areas (Connelly, 2002). It is reported that the Daily Dispatch was read by, on average, 72 530 readers per annum, during the period of 1988 to 2001 (Ryan Megaw, personal communication, January 28, 2004). The articles selected for analysis were published in the Daily Dispatch between 1988 and 2001. The only criterion as a point of selection of articles, was a reference to the word emigration. In total, 60 articles were selected and analysed.

The process of analysis began with the coding of the articles. As previously discussed, coding allows for themes to become apparent and for the elimination of articles that did not meet the parameters of this research. Subsequent to the coding, the analysis began, focusing on the variability and consistency of the content and the function and consequence of the dominant media discourses identified as the pertinent interpretative repertoires.

The extracts selected for discussion illustrate the patterns in the data, through both their variability and consistency. The linguistic evidence within these extracts also allows for the functions and consequences of the discourses to be explored.

Furthermore, many of the discourses uncovered, are interconnected. The constructions discussed are reliant on one another and the interpretative repertoires often support each other (Potter and Wetherell, 1987). However, for the purposes of this discussion, only the dominant discourses are highlighted and therefore the discussion is limited to the relevance of those constructions.

Finally, as this research focused on articles published between 1988 and 2001, the chronological sequence of the articles was important as it clearly points to the political and social changes which occurred, from Apartheid South Africa, into transition and finally a democratic South Africa.

6. Discussion

6.1 The Brain-Drain – Discourses of Economics

Emigration has clear economic implications, with economic factors having been identified as being a non-proximate cause for emigration. The economy of the country of origin can be considered as a push factor, whereas the economy of the country of destination would be a pull factor (Mostert et. al., 1998). As introduced in a previous section, the brain drain is a movement of skilled individuals (Polonsky, et. al., 1988). This global movement has ramifications for both the country of origin and country of

destination. However, it is the country of origin that receives the most attention. The skills that these professionals carry with them are often acquired at great expense to the taxpayer of the country of origin (through public support of higher education) (Polonsky, et. al., 1988). Therefore, the discourse of economics reflects constructs of a negative judgment on the actions of those leaving with skills paid for by the taxpayer. An alternative view that is often overlooked is that of the global network established as a result of this movement (Koelble, 1998). “The globalisation of economic activity produces a worldwide uniformity in international legal regimes outside of the control of the various nation-states and fosters within each domestic context an ‘Americanization’ of business practice” (Koelble, 1998: 5). This then implies that although the country of origin is losing skills, it is gaining because of the networks formed and the economic possibilities that these networks will create.

It is not just the economy of the countries that are noteworthy in this analysis, but also the personal economic status of the individuals concerned (Koelble, 1998). Due to the fact that emigration is an expensive endeavor, it is reasonable to hypothesise that the wealthy have more access to the prospects of emigration. This discourse therefore, constructs a negative representation of those who consider emigration. Social construction theory does acknowledge the existence of materiality, although it is the constructs of that materiality that are of interest (Parker, 1998). Therefore, constructions of personal wealth are often associated with power. The rhetoric of arguing against emigration, or portraying it as an unpatriotic act, opens up the abstraction that those wanting to leave are those who most benefited economically under Apartheid.

The following two extracts accentuate the dichotomous attributes of economy, national economy and personal economy, with reference to emigration.

Extract 1: “There is clearly a danger that the unfavourable economic climate and the unsettled political situation could result in a massive loss of crucial skills which are vital to the development of South Africa,” the chairman and managing director of Market Research Africa, Mr. Clive Corder, said.
(250 000 foresee leaving SA – poll, *Daily Dispatch*, 23 July 1991)

Extract 2: Canadian interests are out to attract increasing numbers of top South Africans in terms of that country’s Government backed Business Immigration Programme. The company’s vice-president, Barry Cartwright, will be in South Africa next week to talk to would-be Canadians who have a net worth of at least R1,2 million. Those who are accepted will be offered permanent residence in Canada and blue-chip investment opportunities. (Canada woos South Africans, *Daily Dispatch*, 28 April 1992)

Extract one communicates the importance of national wealth by referring to the unfavourable economic climate before the ‘unsettled’ political situation. The interpretative repertoire of ‘economic climate’ is a metaphor that allows the reader to ‘feel’ the economy as they would the weather, suggesting a sense of unpredictability. This metaphor implies that the economy is intangible, mutable, uncontrollable and beyond individual agency. On the other hand, this unpredictability also enhances the

possibility of the economy becoming favourable. However, in order for this to occur, the skills that would yield the economic growth of South Africa, must be employed within South Africa. The use of realist-empiricist discourse within this extract serves as a warning to South Africans as it is delivered by an expert, giving it more credibility, thereby demonstrating the danger as a reality (Dixon, et. al., 1994).

Extract two is an illustration of the taken-for-granted assumption that those wanting to emigrate are wealthy within their own personal capacity. The interpretative repertoire of 'net worth' alludes to images of affluence, high social standing and power. Individuals within this category are referred to as 'would-be Canadians' which reinforces the idea that their status as immigrant can be purchased in exchange for their material wealth. This in turn amplifies their power, as they have the mobility to make personal decisions, which have far-reaching effects on the economic development of South Africa. Therefore the personal interfaces with the public. Economic mobility also implies status, and belonging to upper-middle class to upper class segments of society. Hence, constructions of class distinctions are also implied.

Extract 3: A 47% increase in immigrants to South Africa between January and September and a 33% decrease in emigrants meant there was a net gain of 1 600 people as compared with a net loss of 4000 for the same period last year, according to the figures released by the Central Statistical Services in Pretoria. (Survey: SA liberals more likely to quit, *Daily Dispatch*, 16 November 1988)

Within the economic discourse is the interpretative repertoire of 'net gain' and 'net loss'. This terminology elicits an image of checks and balances, in which the migratory patterns both out of and into South Africa, suggest a great, unseen balance sheet.

In order to be a self-sufficient, independent and wealthy country (values that are highly regarded within capitalist ideology), the economy needs to be a powerhouse, something which is unattainable in an unpredictable milieu, where the contenders withdraw from their country of origin and take with them their capital and skills. The notion is constructed that those individuals with skills and money who intend leaving South Africa, owe South Africa. They have a responsibility to their country of origin.

Statistical evidence is a strategy used within realist-empiricist discourses (Dixon, et. al., 1994). "A statistic describes a sample and serves as an estimate of the corresponding population parameter" (Webster, 1992: 7). Therefore, statistics are deemed invaluable when trying to understand a social phenomenon and the extent of that phenomenon. Statistics serve to "aide in the decision-making and problem solving process [and thereby] prediction" (Webster, 1992: 9). Consequently, the use of statistics with reference to emigration is an intentional strategy, which implies that emigration is a problem and therefore, decisions need to be taken in order to solve this problem.

Extract three represents this strategy, using statistics as a tool within press discourses, thereby offering a particular representation and interpretation (Dixon, et. al., 1994). The source, the Central Statistical Services, is reputable and the figures released, are

constructions of the migratory processes affecting South Africa. This, therefore, creates an impression of the true extent of both emigration and immigration and serves as a reliable counter of the gains and losses. However, statistical evidence was used not only to reflect the numbers of those leaving and entering South Africa, but also to magnify and attribute political affiliation, thereby highlighting (as in extract 4) the power relationships between those who are emigrating and the ruling party, and those members who intend staying.

Extract 4: About 60% of the respondents who intend emigrating said they supported the Progressive Federal Party or Independent Party. Most of those who supported the National Party or New Republic Party (91%) said they would stay. (Survey: SA liberals more likely to quit, *Daily Dispatch*, 16 November 1988)

This, again, gives a construction and a representation of how the voting public is engaging with the possibilities of emigrating. This article was published in 1988, a time of political conflict, and the statistical evidence indicates that a large percentage of the supporters of the ruling Apartheid government are not considering emigrating whereas the supporters of the opposition are. Statistics in this respect were not used to emphasize a problem, but were used rather to make a claim of the truth-out-there, by reflecting the political affiliations of White South Africans through the lens of emigration. These statistics, therefore, represent Afrikaans nationalists, supporters of the National Party, or loyalists and patriots who are not considering leaving their country of birth, while, the

more liberal, often English-speaking Whites are more likely to emigrate. This serves to sustain the divide between Afrikaans and English-speaking White South Africans, and expresses notions of nationalism and patriotism; that is that the English-speaking are unpatriotic as they are considering leaving their country of birth, whereas the Afrikaans-speaking are stalwarts, supporting the policies of the National Party. It must be noted, however, that this research is dealing with broad patterns of ethnicity and political support. The implication is that there is stereotypical rendering of social groups, by excluding those outside of these patterns.

In analysing the economic discourses of emigration, it is found that they serve to vindicate the negative constructions of those who emigrate or who are considering emigrating. What is of particular interest is the way in which these discourses, and the disapproval attendant to emigration, has continued into the post-apartheid era. This then allows for the continuation of the brain drain to be considered contrary to the ideological stance of the new democratic South Africa.

6.2 Exodus – Discourses of Nationalism and Race

6.2.1 Nationalism

Nationalism is both an ideology and a behaviour, and therefore prescribes pertinent attitudes and an appropriate agenda of practice (Kellas, 1988). Billig (1995) concluded that nationalism has both unique and general characteristics because although there is the construction of a particular identity, there is also the right to collectively occupy the nation, referred to as nation space. National identity depends “upon the creation and

maintenance of national categories”, such as South African (Billig, 1997: 49).

Furthermore, national identity features additional group identities, such as White English-speaking or Afrikaans (Billig, 1997). Nevertheless, the national category also “carries particular meanings [about] political statements, evoking an ideological history of entitlement and rights” (Billig, 1997: 50). Nationalism can be constructed as a “psychological phenomenon – usually as loyalty towards one’s nation or dislike of other nations” (Heywood, 1998: 156).

Social identity, one of the groups within national identity, is “conceptualized as that aspect of a person’s self-concept based on their group membership; it was a person’s definition of self in terms of some social group membership with the associated value connotations and emotional significance” (Turner, 2000: 8). Therefore, social identity is determined by the knowledge of belonging to a particular social group and the meanings that such an affiliation contains (Reicher and Hopkins, 2001). With reference to emigration, constructs of both national identity and social identity are apparent.

However, most of the articles analysed, mentioned primarily the narratives of emigration of the White population (as illustrated by extract 5). Therefore, although the social identity for both groups, White Afrikaans-speaking and White English-speaking, was based on race, each group had different meanings for its members, including, in many cases, class distinctions. Although the language spoken by the groups was the defining difference, the meanings of culture, national space, and nationalism also differed. Social identity requires social comparison (Reicher and Hopkins, 2001). This is apparent in

many of the articles, where reference is made to one group compared to another in relation to their ideas of emigration.

Extract 5: Judy Maddams and her husband Gerald spent three dreadful years in England before going home to South Africa...Heated debates on whether or not to emigrate are as much a part of English-speaking South Africans' life as braais and BMW's...Nor did they leave for political reasons – rather, they felt “vaguely British” and sensed a gnawing if ill defined uneasiness about the future...Most South Africans who return home betray a sense of failure. Friends are invariably “oh so understanding”. But even if they were thoroughly miserable throughout the stay abroad, few regret the experience. If nothing else, it makes them appreciate what SA has to offer. (Chickens return to their SA roost, *Daily Dispatch*, 31 March 1988)

The Maddams are an English-speaking South African family. Being a White English-speaking South African, therefore, encompasses numerous constructions, such as political affiliation, class and cultural understandings. The Maddams felt ‘vaguely British’, which can be a construction of being a White English-speaking South African influenced by colonial discourses. However, upon their arrival in England, they realised that South Africa was home. It thus became evident that being English-speaking does not necessarily equate to being British. English-speaking South African national identity is different from British national identity. The rhetoric of this extract (and of other articles) is that emigration is bound as a phenomenon that is prevalent in the English-speaking

group. It must be noted however, that there is much anecdotal evidence in these extracts of Afrikaans-speaking people emigrating, but by arguing that it is more prevalent in the English-speaking group, serves to reinforce nationalistic ideology amongst the Afrikaans-speaking group and reserves the negative connotations of disloyalty for the English group

This extract makes reference to South Africa as being home. 'Home' as an interpretative repertoire has many connotations, perhaps the most obvious being, belonging. Billig (1997) makes reference to ideological histories contributing to a sense of entitlement and rights. As referred to earlier, Afrikaner nationalism, through religious and other discourses, proclaimed entitlements and rights. English nationalism revered the entitlements and rights differently, but this research reveals that both groups share national space and experience entitlement to that space. However, what also becomes apparent is that the English group experiences a sense of displacement and have less of a sense of belonging.

Extract 6: They also complained that there was a general feeling of being unwanted or unappreciated..."You must contribute to creating, promoting and maintaining a united democratic South Africa where all its citizens will be such proud nationals that they will see no need to leave this country".
(Professor asks pupils to fight brain drain, *Daily Dispatch*, 9 October 1998)

This extract again underscores the importance of social connection. When one belongs to a social group or a nation, the ideology prescribes connection, or possibly even kinship.

However, in this extract, there is a plea. 'United democratic South Africa' constructs a vision of being united, of belonging with the other groups, thereby eliminating the differentiation and becoming one. The use of the word citizen evokes connotations of belonging, as it denotes membership.

Extract 7: Mr. Mandela told journalists in Grand Baie during a state visit to Mauritius that "real South Africans would not run away from the high levels of crime in South Africa." National Party spokesman Juli Kilian said in a statement yesterday it was "extremely irresponsible and ludicrous for the president...to measure patriotism in terms of the willingness of people to be subjected to criminality." She urged the government to do more to fight crime and called on all South Africans who were thinking of leaving the country not to do so while there was still hope of "restoring order and discipline"...He said President Mandela was clearly mistaken when he said real South Africans would not leave the country because of crime..."Indeed, some of the people have been frightened by the high level of crime but we are convinced that real South Africans are being sorted out in the course of that process, who are saying: "This is my country, I am not going to run away from the troubles in my country, I am here to serve my country." (NP, DP slate Mandela's crime stance, *Daily Dispatch*, 14 September 1999)

A dominant interpretative repertoire, which emerges in this extract, is that of 'real South Africans'. This constructs ideals of authenticity, of being an authentic South African

who is patriotic and faithful. These are taken-for-granted elements of national identity. The use of this interpretative repertoire therefore, emphasises national identity and affiliation to South Africa, regardless of the troubles that exist within the country. The rhetoric of being real implies that those who leave South Africa are deemed to be unpatriotic and unfaithful and are therefore not wanted.

This interpretative repertoire makes use of the realist-empiricist discourse by quoting a powerful and credible political figure who appeals to notions of authenticity. This strategy provides a neutral stance for the article, as it is merely reporting on the events, and gives equal voice to the opposition of that statement. This then allows the reader to take the position of either agreeing with the construct of being real, or with the opposition. The phrase of 'being real' was used by the then President, Nelson Mandela, in reference to the attention given to emigration. However, the counteraction to that powerful voice, is emotive language, again using direct quotations. "I am here to serve my country" is laden with constructions of patriotism and national spirit. The consequence of this emotive language gives a sense of humility, loyalty and a willingness to fight, creating a place of belonging. In this extract, the opposition is lambasting the President for using the phrase 'real South Africans' and yet the constructions offered by opposition equate to the same understanding. Emigration is unpatriotic and is therefore negatively constructed.

Emigration, in relation to social identity, is constructed by advancing the idea that those who do emigrate, and even those who are thinking about it, belong to the White English-

speaking, upper-middle class groups and that they do not share the same sense of national identity as other South Africans. The constructions are then of disloyalty and displacement and imply that the emigrants are unpatriotic and unwanted. Exodus is therefore an appropriate metaphor as its connotation is that of persecution – those who think of leaving are persecuted for it, and those who do leave experience a sense of persecution.

6.2.2 Race

As the above discussion on nationalism and social identity reveals, little reference was made to the other population groups of South Africa. This is a reflection of the power dynamics that influence constructions of nationalism. As mentioned, the outweighing focus of the articles was on the White's position on emigration. This then raises questions, as the readership of this newspaper was and is statistically mostly Black. Emigration is not restricted to the White population, and does not affect only the White population. However, the dominant discourses construct emigration as a White phenomenon, as shown in extract eight.

Extract 8: Managers most likely to quit the country are English speaking, in their 30's and "liberal" while "more conservative, older, Afrikaans speaking" managers are intent on staying... "It is paradoxical, however, that those most likely to contribute to the achievement of a non-racial democratic society, in the sense that they are 'liberal' and also managers who have power, are those most likely to leave the country. If you believe that Blacks will dominate and it is

assumed that that is what you wish, why leave? One would expect, in theory at least, that that is exactly why the 'leavers' should stay and the 'stayers' leave", the article comments. (Survey: SA liberals more likely to quit, *Daily Dispatch*, 16 November 1988)

Discourses of power legitimate a particular account of social reality, thereby silencing dissonant versions (Strebel, 1997). The interpretative repertoires of 'stayers' and 'leavers' constructs a moral discord between the liberals and conservatives. However, in relation to race, this repertoire is limited to the White ethnic group and excludes the many other South Africans who opposed the Apartheid government. The articles analysed, did not express the views of the Black and other populations with respect to emigration. During Apartheid, but particularly during the state of emergency, there was media censorship along with the economic marginalization of black voices from the commercial mainstream press, which precluded certain viewpoints from being expressed. This again is illustrative of power and the silencing of other accounts. Amongst the most obvious dissenting, but unheard accounts were of political exiles. However, these can be legitimately silenced by the official, legal definition of emigration. Therefore legal discourses have a bearing on the construction of emigration. This extract also highlights the dominance of the White perspective. Emigration is constructed as a phenomenon, which affects only the White, affluent population of South Africa. Again, this reinforces the power of prevalence by silencing the construction of the 'Other than White' populations subjectivities of emigration.

Extract 9: The 'brain drain' was a direct result of the government's education policies and its emphasis on academic instead of technical education, the BMF said. Existing training buttressed an economic infrastructure designed primarily for the White minority. "If we do not start investing in our own people the moving time bomb of millions of Blacks living in abject poverty will explode in our face," the BMF said. (Govt's campaign to recruit overseas skills criticised, *Daily Dispatch*, 26 July 1989)

According to this article, the 'brain drain' was the result of government policies. Not being White excluded certain population groups from obtaining equal qualifications, thereby excluding them from opportunities to emigrate. The use of the interpretative repertoires of 'White minority' and 'millions of Blacks' connotes a sense of outnumbering and tension, which is strengthened by the metaphor of an exploding time bomb.

Extract 10: The African National Congress spokesman in the Eastern Cape, Mr. Thobile Mhlaho, described White fears of a new South Africa as groundless yesterday, and said an exodus out of the country by Whites was senseless, SABC radio news reported... With the help of White South Africans, South Africa could develop into the superpower of Africa. (ANC: White exodus senseless, *Daily Dispatch*, 9 June 1993)

The interpretative repertoire of 'superpower' evokes feelings of potency and eligibility. However, this article was published in 1993, just short of a year prior to the first democratic election. Thus, the interpretative repertoires of 'White fears' and 'exodus' demonstrated the changes that were occurring in the power structures. The acknowledgment of the need for help from White South Africans in this extract, constructs the reconciliatory ideology of what was to become the New South Africa, that of The Rainbow Nation. This metaphor creates a vision of difference yet united, that all the ethnic race groups of South Africa can blend together, equally

When the media reported on emigration, the focus was on the White population. Although there is anecdotal evidence of Black emigrants, referred to as exiles, there is little reference to this in the articles analysed. Power legitimises a particular version of social reality, while silencing others. In the phenomenon of emigration, the voices of the exiles are silenced; their versions of their social reality are deemed inapplicable, whereas the dominant narratives of White emigration are given status, thereby producing and reproducing power relations. Therefore it can be concluded that racial issues, and therefore issues of power, are included in the constructions of emigration.

6.3 Chicken Run – Discourse of Rationalism

Bakhtin suggested that psychological states "are formed in interaction, especially interaction involving the use of language. If one wishes to study such states, then one should study interaction and utterances" (Bakhtin, 1973, cited in Billig, 1998: p39). Therefore, every utterance is formulated in response to an (often implicit and silent)

preceding utterance (Billig, 1998). This is significant for this research, as although there is little direct evidence, there is inference via the dialogic quality of language that Bakhtin referred to as ‘answerability’. The following extracts reveal some of the rationale behind decisions to emigrate, although it is far more complex than just these reasons, thereby giving insight into the answerability referred to by Bakhtin (1973).

Extract 11: Mr. Nixon said yesterday that the decision to emigrate had been a difficult one, but was made largely because the family was not prepared in principle to allow their son, now in Standard 8, to do military service. “This is not because of fear but because of the role of the army and what it does,” Mr. Nixon said. To agree to military service would contradict everything he believed in and had worked for, he added. (Nixon packing for Perth, *Daily Dispatch*, 20 February 1988)

During the Apartheid years, one of the most prominent and contentious rationales for emigrating was resistance to conscription. This emphasises that leaving South Africa allowed for the continuation of a moral value and belief system that was incompatible with the policies of the Apartheid government. Leaving was therefore an honourable option. This can be instructively contrasted with the present:

Extract 12: Whereas in the past political motivations, national service and political uncertainty drove doctors overseas, “more recently it’s the cash incentive that is attracting them to other countries. It’s not political anymore.”

(People leaving SA outnumber immigrants two to one, *Daily Dispatch*, 10 January 1995)

In the post-Apartheid era, the construction becomes very different and therefore contradictory. The interpretative repertoire of 'cash incentive' rouses an image of selfishness, of individual gain and benefit, as opposed to collective belonging and advantage. The desire for money is the motivation for leaving South Africa. The political reasons of the past become null and void, thereby revealing alternate constructions. Therefore there is a contradiction, because leaving in the past was understood in terms of politics and yet today emigration is still occurring, even although the political situation has stabilised and moral issues are no longer problematic. Therefore, the rhetoric surrounding emigration is still negative, and the significance of this contradiction is weighty; as if emigration could be justified, the negative connotations were deemed less notable.

Extract 13: "Some of the reasons given for their desire to leave are a high rate of crime, concern for their children's future, or the high quality of education, better job prospects and better living standards where they are heading to."

"Others said they had no confidence in the present government, or they were worried about affirmative action and about the deteriorating economy."

(Professor asks pupils to fight brain drain, *Daily Dispatch*, 9 October 1998)

South African politics has a turbulent history. Prior to the democratic elections of 1994, political uncertainty and instability were cited as reasons for emigration. The Apartheid government secured certain privileges for the White population through political policies. However, when it became apparent that a democratic government would no longer secure those privileges, the White population began to experience skepticism about their future, thereby legitimising their reason for leaving South Africa. However, the constructions changed with the changing of social and political structures and were replaced with the interpretative repertoire, 'lack of confidence' in the present government. One of the many connotations of this repertoire is that of racism. Disguising ill feelings of lack of confidence towards the Black government feed into the indoctrinated sense of superiority. Political policies, such as affirmative action, disadvantaging the previously advantaged place the White South African in the 'Other than White' position, which underscores feelings of displacement, fear and resentment surrounding that metamorphosis.

The interpretative repertoire of 'future' encompasses the quality of education, living standards and crime. Constructions of the taken-for-granted freedom that was afforded to the White population of Apartheid South Africa were shattered when Apartheid collapsed. Although crime raises many anxieties such as personal safety, and can include physical threat, a major component is the perceived loss a way of life. Constructions of boomed-off areas and razor wire, restrict crime, but they also alter the way White South Africans live. The desire to live in a country without crime is not a motivating force, but rather to live in a country where they can recapture their freedom, is. Although there is little evidence within the articles to substantiate this claim it can be

inferred through Bakhtin's (1973) notion of answerability. A further component of the constructs of crime is that of victimization. Crime implies perpetrator and victim. The constructions of perpetrator are barbaric, immoral, lacking empathy or human compassion, devaluing human life and taking what is not rightfully theirs. Contrary to that, are the constructions of victim; innocent, did not encourage the act, vulnerable, loss of possession or life, loss of dignity and fear. With these constructions in mind, it becomes obvious that when crime is referred to as a rationale for emigration, it is through the victim, not the perpetrator, that credence is given to the rationale, since victims are often regarded with sympathy. However, with regard to the constructions of emigration, although the explanation of crime being a motivating factor for emigration is highly acknowledged, it is still regarded in a negative light. The sympathy given to victims is revoked and is instead replaced with disdain. There are implicit accusations that those who emigrate are perpetrators, committing an offense against larger South African society.

The political and social change that occurred in South Africa altered the constructions of the way White people understood their social identity resulting in a reconstruction of their responses to new circumstances. The above discussion illustrates that there is a relationship between many of the rationales for emigration. Emigration was justified in relation to the changing circumstances. However, the constructions of emigration, throughout the decades, have remained negative. The chicken run is an apt metaphor, often used in the headlines of articles to depict the rationalism of emigration. Thus, the

reader's interpretation is influenced by constructions of cowardice and of patriotism, or the lack thereof.

7. Conclusion

The discursive framework used with reference to emigration reveals how the South African mass media has constructed the phenomenon. The metaphors of brain drain, exodus and chicken run are explicit indicators that point to the negativity of the constructions. However, there are also more subtle discursive elements at play.

Economic discourses construct perceptions of indifference for the common good of the collective society by those who emigrate. There are inferences that those who are economically mobile have the option to emigrate, but in doing so, they are ignoring certain (tacit) responsibilities. These responsibilities are implied through discourses of patriotism. However, the economic discourses also serve to reinforce the negative constructs of emigration by attempting to hold individuals who emigrate, accountable for the economic growth or decline of South Africa.

Discourses of nationalism also act to facilitate, and feed off, the dominant constructions of national identity. The South African mass media has constructed emigration as an unpatriotic phenomenon. The implications draw a further divide between English-speaking and Afrikaans-speaking White South Africans, those in different classes and almost entirely ignores all other population groups.

There is very little reference to Blacks who are considering emigrating. Even in the post-Apartheid era, the dominant narratives are predominantly about White South Africans. This suggests that discourses of power are interlinked with discourses of race, thereby legitimising the position and social reality of the White population and silencing that of the Black population.

People have legitimised emigration from South Africa by referring to common rationales, ranging from moral discord to crime. Emigration was viewed as being honourable if done in moral opposition to Apartheid ideology and principles. However, in post-Apartheid times this view of emigration has changed, although it is still the same group of people leaving. Emigration is thus constructed as cowardly, unpatriotic and even racist.

In conclusion, the Daily Dispatch has constructed emigration as a phenomenon that is predominately considered by wealthy, English-speaking White, liberal South Africans. This construction has serious implications as it ignores other racial and ethnic groups and enhances the discourses of difference and power. A personal statement about where a person wants to be, becomes a public, moral, political and racial statement about belief in the future.

Reference List

- Blackman, L and Walkerdine, V. (2001). *Mass hysteria. Critical psychology and media studies*. Hampshire: Palgrave.
- Billig, M. (1991). *Ideology and opinions: studies in rhetoric psychology*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Billig, M. (1995). *Banal nationalism*. London: Sage Publications.
- Billig, M. (1997). Discursive, rhetorical and ideological messages. In: McGarty, C. and Haslam, S.A. eds. *The message of social psychology*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.
- Burr, V. (1995). *An introduction to social constructionism*. London: Sage Publications.
- Butler, A. (1998). *Democracy and Apartheid*. London: Macmillan Press.
- Connelly, M. (2002). *Rumours of war: de-constructing media discourses of HIV/AIDS in South Africa*. Unpublished Masters dissertation of Psychology: Rhodes University.
- Crush, J. (2002). "The global raiders: nationalism, globalisation and the South African brain drain." *Journal of International Affairs*, 56(1). Available <http://web14.epnet.com/citation.asp?tb> [accessed on 21-02-2003]
- Dixon, J.A., Foster, D.H., Durrheim, K. and Wilbraham, L. (1994). "Discourse and the politics of space in South Africa: the 'squatter crisis'". *Discourse and Society* 5(3), 277-296.
- Downing, J., Mohammadi, A. and Sreberny-Mohammadi, A. (Eds.). (1995). *Questioning the media. A critical introduction*. London: Sage Publications.
- Edwards, D., Potter, J. and Middleton, D. (1992). "Toward a discursive psychology of remembering." *Psychologist*, 5, 441-447.
- Forgey, H., Jeffery, A., Sidiropoulos, E., Smith, C., Corrigan, T., Mophuthing, T., Helman, A., Redpath, J. and Dimant, T. (1999). *South African Survey 1999 2000 Millenium edition*. Johannesburg: South African Institute of Race Relations.
- Gergen, K.J. (2001). *Social construction in context*. London: Sage Publications.
- Heywood, A. (1998). *Political ideologies*. London: Macmillian Press.

- Horowitz, S. and Kaplan, D. (2001). "The Jewish Exodus from the New South Africa: realities and implications". *International Migration*, 39(3) 1-15.
- Hylland Eriksen, T. (2002). *Ethnicity and nationalism*. London: Pluto Press.
- Kellas, J. (1998). *The politics of nationalism and ethnicity*. Hampshire: Macmillan Press.
- Koelble, T.A. (1998). *The global economy and democracy in South Africa*. London: Rutgers University Press.
- Lindesmith, A.R., Strauss, A.L. and Denzin, N.K. (1999). *Social psychology*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- "Losing the best and the brightest". (2002, December). *Canada and the World Background*, 68(3). Available: <http://web14.epnet.com/citation.asp?ug> [accessed on 21-02-2003]
- Megaw, R. ryanm@dispatch.co.za (2004, January 28, personal communication). Re: Daily Dispatch circulation [accessed on 04-02-2004]
- Mills, S. (1997). *Discourse*. London: Routledge.
- Moss, G. and Obery, I. (Eds.) (1987). *South African review 4*. Johannesburg: Raven Press.
- Mostert, W.P., Hofmeyr, B.E., Oosthuizen, J.S. and van Zyl, J.A. (1998). *Demography: Textbook for the South African student*. Pretoria: HSRC Publishers.
- Neuman, W.L. (1991). *Social research methods*. Needham Heights: Allyn and Bacon.
- Nightingale, D.J. and Cromby, J. (1999). *Social constructionist psychology*. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- "Outward bound". (2002, September 9). *Economist*, 364(8291). Available: <http://www14.epnet.com/citation.asp?tb> [accessed on 21-02-2003]
- Parker, I. (Ed.) (1998). *Social constructionism, discourse and realism*. London: Sage
- Polonsky, M.J., Scott, D.R. and Suchard, H.T. (1988). "Motivations of South African emigrants". *Applied Economics*, 20 1293.
- Potter, J. and Wetherell, M. (1987). *Discourse and social psychology. Beyond attitudes and behaviours*. London: Sage Publications.

- Potter, J. and Wetherell, M. (1995). Discourse analysis. In: Smith, J.A., Harre, R and Van Langenhove, L. *Rethinking methods in psychology* (pp. 80-107). London: Sage Publications.
- Reicher, S. and Hopkins, N. (2001). *Self and nation*. London: Sage Publications.
- Sarbin, T.R. and Kitsuse, J.I. (1994). A prologue to constructing the social. In Sarbin, T.R. and Kitsuse, J.I.(Eds.) (1995). *Constructing the social*. (pp.3-8). London: Sage Publications.
- Stillwell, J. and Congdon, P. (1991). Migration modelling: concepts and contents. In J. Stillwell and P. Congdon. (Eds). *Migration models: macro and micro approaches* (pp. 1-16). London: Belhaven Press.
- Strebel, A. (1997). Putting discourse analysis to work in AIDS prevention. In A. Levett, A. Kottler, E. Burman and I. Parker (Eds). *Culture, power and difference: Discourse Analysis in South Africa* (pp.109-121). Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press.
- Street, J. (2001). *Mass media, politics and democracy*. Hampshire: Palgrave.
- Thomas, L. and Wareing, S. (1999). *Language, society and power*. London: Routledge.
- Triandafyllidou, A. (1999). "Nation and immigration: a study of the Italian press discourse". *Social Identities*, 5(1). Available: <http://web14.epnet.com/citation.asp?> [accessed on 21-02-2003]
- Turner, J.C. (2000). Some current issues in research on social-identity and self-categorization theories. In: Ellemers, N., Spears, R. and Doosje, B. eds. (2000). *Social Identity*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.
- Webster, A. (1992). *Applied statistics for business and economics*. Boston: Irwin.
- Willig, C. (2001). *Qualitative research in psychology*. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- Wood, L.A. and Kroger, R.O. (2000). *Doing discourse analysis*. London: Sage Publications.
- Worden, N. (1994). *The making of modern South Africa: conquest, segregation and Apartheid*. Oxford: Blackwell Publisher.

APPENDIX I

ARTICLES FROM WHICH EXTRACTS ARE TAKEN

Nixon packing for Perth - 20 February 1988

JOHANNESBURG – A former Progressive Federal Party provincial councillor for Johannesburg North, Mr. Peter Nixon, is to emigrate to Australia in May. Mr. Nixon said yesterday that the decision to emigrate had been a difficult one, but was made largely because the family was not prepared in principle to allow their son, now in Standard 8, to do military service. "This is not because of fear but because of the role of the army and what it does," Mr. Nixon said. To agree to military service would contradict everything he believed in and had worked for, he added. The move had to be made quickly, as Australian emigration restrictions meant he could not apply after the age of 45, which he reached this year. "I feel like anybody leaving a country where his family has been for a long time – very sore," Mr. Nixon said. He served as the PFP spokesman on education on the provincial council from 1974 to 1986, through some of the most tumultuous events in South African education. Mr. Nixon, who holds a master's degree in physics from the University of Pretoria and lectured at the university for more than three years, worked at Woodmead School, one of Johannesburg's private non-racial schools, for 10 years. His last six years at the school were as headmaster. Mr. Nixon left Woodmead in 1986 to take up a post as the executive director of an independent agency, the Science Education Project, which provides in-service training to unqualified teachers. – Sapa

Chickens return to their SA roost – 31 March 1988

South African exiles face scorn at home, coolness overseas. STEPHEN ROBINSON meets on family who left, only to return.

Judy Maddams and her husband Gerald spent three dreadful years in England before going home to South Africa. "It's a funny thing," she said, "but in Watford you never see the horizon. I think that's what I missed most about SA – the sky is just so low in England." Judy still cannot quite put her finger on why her family's time in England was

such a disaster. Nor, in retrospect, can she remember what inspired her and her husband to leave secure jobs and a lovely home in Durban for the uncertainty of a new life in suburban Hertfordshire. Like thousands of White South Africans before them, they joined what is disparagingly known as the “chicken run”. And like many of those who fled, they are back again, somewhat humbled by their experience but hugely relieved to be home. The Maddams’ experience was more traumatic than most. They regretted the move almost as soon as they arrived in Britain with their young daughter Bronwyn and almost no savings. Judy’s parents had themselves emigrated to England a few years before, but she saw much less of them than she had expected, even though they lived nearby. Her weekends, were filled with housework; her evenings recovering from the day’s work. Travel also took its toll: an hour’s drive through rush-hour traffic from their home to work, via Bronwyn’s child-minder. Judy became deeply resentful of her husband. After bearing England for two and a half years, she went back to SA with Bronwyn. Gerald followed her, but by then the marriage had collapsed and she insisted on divorce.

Judy returned to England to try again, but lasted only three months before returning again to SA, this time permanently. Four weeks later they remarried and Judy is expecting her second child. Although their misery was more acute than most people’s the Maddams’ experience is common to many South Africans abroad. Those who come out sense the silent contempt of friends they leave behind, but few South Africans of British descent can honestly claim never to have contemplated emigrating. About 750 000 can lay tenuous claim to a British passport if they shake their family tree hard enough. Heated debates on whether or not to emigrate are as much a part of English-speaking South Africans’ life as braais and BMWs. During the worst of SA’s political unrest and economic recession in early 1986, 1 000 people were leaving a month. Most were White, skilled and extremely difficult and expensive to replace. The net loss of migrants in 1986, was almost 7 000. Last year, the figure halved, reflecting a calmer mood and SA’s modest economic upswing. The Maddams family never conformed to the favoured foreign stereotype of White South Africans. They were comfortable rather than affluent, and employed a daily once a week rather than a live-in maid. Nor did they leave for political reasons – rather, they felt “vaguely British” and sensed a gnawing if ill defined uneasiness about the future.

Once in Britain, Judy, as a qualified radiographer, found a job easily. They had no problems with work permits as Gerald had a British passport, but he discovered that his South African teaching qualification was invalid for the British state system, and was forced initially to 'rep' for a plastic company. "Our salaries looked fine on straight conversion from Rand to Sterling – that is, until we went to buy groceries and found everything in Britain was twice as expensive," Gerald explained. They had not reckoned on the sheer expense of existing in a northern climate, from the unexpected outlay in installing central heating to the prices of theatre tickets. They took out a large mortgage to buy a house for £35 000. But with a combined income of only £15 000, they struggled to make the repayments and there was never any spare funds for holidays.

The best thing in SA the beaches, the mountains, the rivers are free. Gerald was used to canoeing down rushing rivers but found he actually had to pay for the dubious privilege of paddling around discarded refrigerators on a canal. "Before we left we dreamed of the 'culture' all the cinema and theatre in London. When we arrived, we found we simply could not afford to go out, even if we had the energy after struggling home through the traffic," Judy explains. The pressure of life, particularly the commuting, brought appalling strain on the family. Judy found that after battling through the rush-hour traffic she had no energy for Bronwyn and little enthusiasm for Gerald, who sat most nights in front of the television set. British television, which is incomparably better than broadcasts in SA, frequently becomes the favoured form of escape for unhappy expatriates. Finding a suitable child-minder proved particularly difficult and the fees ate up about a quarter of Judy's take-home salary.

Most of the South Africans who return home betray a sense of failure. Friends are invariably "oh so understanding." But even if they were thoroughly miserable throughout the stay abroad, few regret the experience. If nothing else, it makes them appreciate what SA has to offer. Most confirm they could live abroad again if events at home took a really bad turn. When Judy and Gerald returned to SA they bought a house only a few hundred metres from where they lived before, almost as if to reassure themselves that they really were back home. I asked Judy if she and her husband had not put their own immediate happiness above the long-term safety of their daughter and the second child they are now expecting. She fixed me with a disbelieving stare, "If you are talking about

fear, about physical safety, then I have never known anything like the sheer terror you experience on a London tube train late at night." Daily Telegraph.

Survey: SA liberals more likely to quit – 16 November 1988

CAPE TOWN – Managers most likely to quit the country are English speaking, in their 30s and "liberal", while "more conservative, older and Afrikaans speaking" managers are intent on staying. This information came to light in a survey, "The brain drain: why South African managers want to leave or stay". It was conducted by senior lecturer, Dr. Piet Human, and MBA graduate Mr. Jeremy Green, of the graduate school of business at UCT. However, only nine per cent of managers interviewed indicated they would definitely leave. Two-thirds said they would stay and 23 per cent indicated they were unsure. The survey found that the commitment to stay was distinctly related to language group and age. Most Afrikaans-speaking respondents (91 per cent) said they intended staying.

About 60 per cent of the respondents who intend emigrating said they supported the Progressive Federal Party or Independent Party. Most of those who supported the National Party or New Republic Party (91 per cent) said they would stay. Forty-one per cent of the managers who felt that Blacks would dominate government in their lifetime said they would leave the country while 92 per cent of those who disagreed with this view said they were intent on staying. The managers who indicated they wanted to stay were less inclined to get involved in influencing government to effect social and political reform, the survey showed. The majority of "leavers" (81,8 per cent) felt industrial action was the only non-violent political option for Blacks. The "leavers" also indicated that reform was necessary for economic recovery and were sceptical about President P. W. Botha's sincerity. "The responses to most of the questions indicate that a manager's political orientation would strongly influence the decision to stay or leave," a report on the survey in the GSB News said. "It is paradoxical, however, that those most likely to contribute to the achievement of a non-racial democratic society, in the sense that they are 'liberal' and also managers who have power, are those most likely to leave the country. "If you believe that Blacks will dominate and it is assumed that that is what you wish, why leave? One would expect, in theory at least, that that is exactly why the 'leavers' should stay and the 'stayers' leave," the article comments. – Sapa

Govt's campaign to recruit overseas skills criticised – 26 July 1989

CAPE TOWN – It was criminal of the government to spend millions “importing” trained people at the expense of the development and training of Black South Africans, the Black Management Forum (BMF) said yesterday. The BMF was reacting to the Minister of Home Affairs, Mr. Stoffel Botha, who said on television on July 20 that his department spent money to encourage the immigration of skilled people to South Africa. The “brain drain” was a direct result of the government's education policies and its emphasis on academic instead of technical education, the BMF said.

Existing training buttressed an economic infrastructure designed primarily for the White minority. “If we do not start investing in our own people the moving time bomb of millions of Blacks living in abject poverty will explode in our face,” the BMF said. – DDC

250 000 foresee leaving SA – poll – 23 July 1991

JOHANNESBURG – Research figures released yesterday revealed that more than 50 000 White South African adults saw themselves as potential emigrants in the next five years. Market Research Africa's Omnipoll said: “Over a quarter million urban White adults see themselves as living overseas (200 000) or elsewhere in Africa (70 000) within the next five years.” “The intention to leave ... is strongly related to age, and it is clear that it is the younger generation that is the least settled. As many as 15 per cent of 16 to 24-year olds are considering emigration, up from nine per cent in 1987.” “It is clear that the changes taking place in the country are cause for concern to both (White) language groups,” Market Research Africa said. The poll's result are based on interviews with 1 000 urban White adults. “There is clearly a danger that the unfavourable economic climate and the unsettled political situation could result in a massive loss of crucial skills which are vital to the development of South Africa,” chairman and managing director of Market Research Africa, Mr. Clive Corder, said. “... Combined with the declining White birth rate this could result in a far greater reliance on non-White talent in the future.” – Sapa

Canada woos South Africans – 28 April 1992

JOHANNESBURG – Canadian interests are out to attract increasing numbers of top South Africans in terms of that country's Government backed Business Immigration Programme. The company's vice-president, Barry Cartwright, will be in South Africa next week to talk to would-be Canadians who have a net worth of at least R1,2 million. Those who are accepted will be offered permanent residence in Canada and blue chip investment opportunities. – Sapa

ANC: White exodus senseless – 09 June 1993

PORT ELIZABETH – The African National Congress spokesman in the eastern Cape, Mr. Thobile Mhlahlo, described White fears of a new South Africa as groundless yesterday, and said an exodus out of the country by Whites was senseless, SABC radio news reported. Addressing the Federated Hospitality Association of South Africa regional congress in Port Elizabeth, he said all South Africans would have equal rights, in a future dispensation. The ANC's battle was against racism and not against Whites. With the help of White South Africans, South Africa could develop into the super power of Africa. – Sapa

People leaving SA outnumber immigrants two to one – 10 January 1995

Daily Dispatch Correspondent

CAPE TOWN – Nearly twice as many people left South Africa in the first nine months of last year than settled in the country, according to Central Statistical Service (CSS) figures released yesterday. Doctors, business professionals, sales personnel, teachers and engineers made up a fifth of those who emigrated. According to the CSS 8 449 emigrated and 4 980 settled here between January and September last year – a net loss of 3 469 people. This was in contrast to the same period in 1993, when there were 2 733 more immigrants than emigrants. The most popular destinations last year for emigrants were Britain, New Zealand, Australia, Canada and the US. Although the CSS could not provide month-by-month emigration details, reports last year indicated many people left the country before the April elections, including 1 200 people in January alone. Of the emigrants, 1 616 were professional, semi-professional or technically skilled

workers. Only 878 immigrants fell into the same category, meaning a net loss of 738 professionals.

The chairman of the federal council of the Medical Association of SA, Dr. Bernard Mandell, said yesterday the trend was for younger male doctors to go overseas. Whereas in the past political motivations, national service and political uncertainty drove doctors overseas, "more recently it's the cash incentive that is attracting them to other countries. It's not political any more". With the new government's intention to move away from specialists towards general practice, the new dispensation was "not to their financial benefit". Dr. Mandell said the only way to prevent a drain of well-trained medical professionals was to make it worth their while to stay, with not only cash incentives but a long-term "hospitality factor" – such as education benefits for doctors, good working conditions and benefits for their families.

A spokesman for the National Professional Teacher's Organisation of SA (Naptosa) said yesterday the body regretted the drain on expertise and trained professionals, and urged people to "think twice" before emigrating. However, Naptosa was "very confident about the future of South Africa and its inherent ability to create a sound basis on which to build a new nation". The number of tourists to South Africa increased by about 11,5 per cent over the same period, from 2, 436 million to 2,714 million.

Professor asks pupils to fight brain drain – 09 October 1998

By Phakamisa Ngani

UMTATA – A local university academic yesterday called on matric pupils to work towards "arresting" what he described as the growing exodus of South African professionals frustrated by unfulfilled political promises made on the eve of the country's new democracy. Professor Tuntufye Mwamwenda, former education dean at the University of Transkei, was guest speaker at a prize-giving ceremony which doubled up as a farewell function for Grade 12 pupils at the Holy Cross High School here. Prof. Mwamwenda said since the excitement of the 1994 democratic elections, thousands of South Africans - many of them professionals and other experts – had been leaving for other countries in the Americas, Europe or Australia. Quoting statistics, he said 74 percent of respondents interviewed in a survey were reportedly planning to leave the

country soon. A breakdown of those planning to leave revealed that 20 percent were business owners or partners, 20 percent held middle-management positions, while 10 percent were engaged in top management positions. "Some of the reasons given for their desire to leave are a high rate of crime, concern for their children's future, or the high quality of education, better job prospects and better living standards where they are heading to.

"Others said they had no confidence in the present government, or that they were worried about affirmative action and about the deteriorating economy." Prof. Mwamwenda said in the medical field 500 doctors, specialists and dentists had left South Africa between 1994 and 1997. Their reasons for leaving included a desire for exposure to advanced research facilities and uncertainty regarding the country's transformation process. They also complained that there was a general feeling of being unwanted or unappreciated and that there was resentment to government directives stopping state-employed doctors from engaging in part-time private practice.

Prof. Mwamwenda urged matric candidates to prepare themselves for careers that would enable them to take up some of the jobs left vacant as a result of the on-going academic exodus. "You must contribute to creating, promoting and maintaining a united democratic South Africa where all its citizens will be such proud nationals that they will see no need to leave this country." In his introductory remarks, Prof. Mwamwenda heaped praises on Holy Cross High for its "academic excellence" over the past years, describing it as one of the four best schools in the region alongside Mariasell in Matatiele, St James in Cofimvaba and Zingisa here.

NP, DP slate Mandela's crime stance – 14 September 1999

JOHANNESBURG – The Democratic Party and National Party yesterday accused President Nelson Mandela of being irresponsible following statements he made in Mauritius on Saturday about South Africa's crime levels. Mr. Mandela told journalists in Grand Baie during a state visit to Mauritius that "real South Africans would not run away from the high levels of crime in South Africa". National Party spokesman Juli Kilian said in a statement yesterday it was "extremely irresponsible and ludicrous for the president ... to measure patriotism in terms of the willingness of people to be subjected to

criminality". She urged the government to do more to fight crime and called on all South Africans who were thinking of leaving the country not to do so while there was still hope of "restoring order and discipline".

In Johannesburg, Democratic Party leader Tony Leon responded to the comments made by Mr. Mandela. "A recent Idasa survey showed that 58 percent of South Africans regard crime as one of their top three concerns," Mr. Leon said. "Add to this the uncertainty felt by people because nobody knows that Deputy President Thabo Mbeki plans are for the next five years and you begin to understand why South Africans are leaving." He said President Mandela was clearly mistaken when he said real South Africans would not leave the country because of crime.

Real South Africans who were highly trained and skilled in a variety of fields had already transplanted successfully to other countries and thousands more of all races were ready to take their skills elsewhere. President Mandela said in his address to journalists that those who left the country because of crime were few and far between. "Indeed, some of the people have been frightened by the high level of crime but we are convinced that real South Africans are being sorted out in the course of that process, who are saying: 'This is my country, I am not going to run away from the troubles in my country, I am here to serve my country'." He said over the past four years the police had brought down crime levels considerably and the police force was composed of men and women of integrity who were doing a good job under difficult circumstances. The Sunday Times reported yesterday that a survey, conducted by it in March through a questionnaire in its Business Times appointments section, found 74 percent of respondents to the survey are considering emigrating. Of those surveyed and in jobs, only two percent are unskilled, nearly 20 percent are self-employed and a further 60 percent are drawn from professional and management jobs. As a result, the survey does not represent the demographics of the country, but indicates the attitudes to emigration of one of its scarcest resources – skilled and well-qualified workers. Over 80 percent of the 11 000 respondents had obtained post-matric qualifications.

Just over half those considering leaving (20 percent of whom are business owners or partners, 20 per-cent in the middle management and over 10 percent in top management) said they would emigrate permanently. The major reason for considering

leaving is crime, according to 62 percent of respondents, with children and education coming in a distant second at 19 percent, a better quality of life at 15 percent, and 14 percent for better prospects. A relatively low 10 percent said they had no faith in the government and were concerned about the deteriorating economy and affirmative action. – Sapa

APPENDIX II

HEADLINES

1988

Bloom to quit SA? – 23 January 1988

Fewer people leave SA – 11 February 1988

Nixon packing for Perth - 20 February 1988

10 033 left SA in '87 – 04 March 1988

Chickens return to their SA roost – 31 March 1988

SA loses 45 000 in brain drain – 11 May 1988

Emigrants stream back – 25 May 1988

Survey: SA liberals more likely to quit – 16 November 1988

Immigration increases – 16 November 1988

1989

Conscription causing brain drain – survey – 15 May 1989

Govt's campaign to recruit overseas skills criticised – 26 July 1989

More settle than leave – 28 September 1989

1990

Survey: huge White exodus possible – 8 May 1990

Arrivals outpace leavers – 24 October 1990

Reversal in brain drain – 01 December 1990

1991

Exodus of medical specialists examined – 22 April 1991

Students want to emigrate – 07 May 1991

250 000 foresee leaving SA – poll – 23 July 1991

SA migrants show confidence – Louw – 30 July 1991

1992

More SA migrants – 5 March 1992

Emigration threat increasing – survey – 25 March 1992

Canada woos South Africans – 28 April 1992

1993

HSRC: Afrikaners think of leaving – 11 January 1993

DP pleads: do not emigrate – 25 May 1993

ANC: White exodus senseless – 09 June 1993

Not just Jews who leave SA – SAUJS – 24 June 1993

SA Jews flock to Israel – 28 June 1993

1994

Clamp down on assets, capital sailing away – 12 February 1994

Experts say fewer SA emigrants – 19 February 1994

Emigration up – 25 February 1994

SA brain-drain continues – 11 April 1994

More people emigrating – 12 April 1994

Immigration figures down – 06 July 1994

Record numbers leave SA – 13 July 1994

1995

People leaving SA outnumber immigrants two to one – 10 January 1995

No takers for UK incentives – 06 February 1995

SA loses 3 837 in election year – 06 May 1995

Brain drain figures decrease – 14 July 1995

Fewer people leaving – 03 November 1995

1996

January emigration figures up on 1995 – 14 May 1996

Affirmative action blamed for brain drain – 03 July 1996

Braindrain outstrips immigrants – 04 July 1996

More leaving SA than settling here – 20 July 1996

More SA experts heading overseas – 31 October 1996

SA migration trend reversed – 11 December 1996

1997

Survey shows emigration down – 22 January 1997

Brain-drain of SA scientists 'shocking' – 19 August 1997

'Brain drain to accelerate as wage hikes slow' – 18 October 1997

1998

SA's Black card may mean US green card – 19 January 1998

Brain drain worsening – survey – 17 March 1998

Brain drains and gains in SA's labour market – 02 August 1998

PAC moots 'exit tax' before qualified flee SA over crime – 15 September 1998

Professor asks pupils to fight brain drain – 09 October 1998

1999

Crime, violence major causes of SA brain drain – 16 March 1999

Ducking as the pawpaw hits the fan – 14 May 1999

NP, DP slate Mandela's crime stance – 14 September 1999

More leave than come to stay – 14 October 1999

Brain drain figures flawed says report – 29 December 1999

2000

SA lost 67 941 to emigration from 1988-98 – 03 March 2000

2001

SA future in danger as top minds leave – 06 February 2001

