



**Performing Emil Hartmann – The Importance of Musical
Contextualisation: A practice-based research project**

By

Garreth Robertson

**A mini-thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the
degree of**

Master of Music

In the Department of Music and Musicology at

Rhodes University

Faculty of Humanities

Supervisor Dr. B. McConnachie

<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4456-4129>

Abstract

When embarking on a journey of preparing a musical work for performance, a contextualisation process is undertaken which informs the performer/s of the factors which govern the parameters of the work. In this study, the author performed Emil Hartmann's piano trio op. 10 as a part of an integrated master's degree program. As the composer was not a part of mainland European musical society, information on his life and work was difficult to access, which presented the performer with a contextualisation problem.

This study aimed to highlight the process of contextualisation, in the absence of sufficient literary material, through the lens of Emil Hartmann's piano trio op. 10. The research used a three-pronged methodological approach in order to construct the narrative around Hartmann's life and composition. Through a structured process of using practice-based research to analyse the creative process undertaken by the practitioners, alongside a micro-historical and analytical methodology, the study builds layers of understanding to inform Hartmann's narrative, and thus provides interpretational insight into the execution of the work.

The research finds that, although it is possible to interpret a musical work based on the musical score, there are layers of depth which cannot be accessed without a contextual understanding of the composer and the conditions in which the composition was written. Through forming the narrative on Emil Hartmann and his piano trio, the research uses the methodology to highlight a method which can be undertaken in the absence of contextual knowledge, and thus presents a contextual understanding of Emil Hartmann's narrative. With the constructed knowledge, the author uses the findings based on the methodological approaches to weave a narrative around the life of Emil Hartmann. Applying the information discovered in the findings, interpretational approaches are discussed to inform future performances of the work.

Acknowledgments

Firstly, I would like to thank my supervisor, Dr. Boudina McConnachie, for her care, enthusiasm, and expert guidance in the research process. Your support and encouragement for my passion for the unknown and unexplored within musicology, has inspired me to continue bringing a voice to suppressed musical histories. I thank you for your kindness, listening ear, and your hunger for making the seemingly impossible, possible.

Providing thorough feedback and advice on the theoretical section of this paper, I would like to thank Dr. AJ Bethke. Your passion for learning, as well as nurturing young musicologists and theorists into the academic realm is truly inspiring. Thank you for being accessible and kind enough to offer your assistance in this paper.

Thank you to Prof. Catherine Foxcroft, my practical supervisor, who not only provided expert advice on the creative process undertaken in this project, but for the huge role you played in my musical journey at tertiary level. Without your assistance and investment in my pianistic journey, the performance element of this research would not have been possible.

To Ilana Chirombo, I thank you wholeheartedly for your continued support, advice, and investment within my practical and academic endeavours. You were a critical friend within this process and shared the passion and enthusiasm for Hartmann's narrative with me. Thank you for all the hours spent listening and embodying the Hartmann trio, and for constantly reminding me about the magic of micro-historical inquiry.

The performance of Hartmann's piano trio would not have been possible without both the participants, Zanta Hofmeyr and Susan Mouton, who gave so much of their time and expertise to help form this research. I am truly indebted to you for all that I have learnt throughout the practical process, and I am honoured to have had the opportunity to discover Hartmann's piano trio with you. Thank you for believing in my musical world, and for fully immersing yourselves within the creative process. I am forever grateful.

Without the support and love of the friends who have been there throughout every step of this process, I would not have been able to reach the finish line. The care, love, and listening ears that each of you provided will remain with me forever. Thank you!

To my parents, Charnette Oosthuizen and Keith Robertson, your role as parents have been unwavering, and I am so grateful for your care and support throughout every significant milestone I have undertaken. Throughout my journey as a musician, you were both there from the very beginning, providing music tuition, coming to concerts, and always supporting me on my journey down a road less travelled. I thank you with love.

To my aunty and uncle, Rae and Gavin Dovey, who have been my second parents and number one supporters, I thank you for all the kindness you have shown me throughout my academic journey. Your support, emotionally and financially, has been constant, and this journey would not have been possible without your continued love and care. Thank you for being such role models to me, and for constantly motivating me to be the best person I can be.

Lastly, a huge thank you to all the music teachers who have been a part of my musical journey, and specifically to Lidia Tzoneva, for sparking my passion for music in high school, and for your expert guidance in my musical endeavour. Without your dedication and passion, I would not have been able to forge my way as a professional musician in the field. Your support has persisted beyond the school walls, and I am forever grateful for your magical touch in my journey as a musician. I dedicate this thesis to you with gratitude and love.

Table of Contents

Abstract	ii
Acknowledgments	iii
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
1.1. Background	1
1.2. Research aims	2
1.3. Chapter outline	3
1.4. Terminology	4
1.5. Presentation of source material	6
1.6. Clarification	8
1.7. Conclusion	9
Chapter 2: Methodology	10
2.1. Theoretical framework	10
2.1.1. Practice-based research (PBR)	11
2.1.2. Micro-history	13
2.1.3. Musical analysis	14
2.2. Method	15
2.3. Conclusion	17
Chapter 3: Practice-Based Research	18
3.1. Observations: Practice based in action	18
3.1.1. Theme 1 – Instrumentation	19
3.1.2. Theme 2 – Influence	22
3.3.3. Theme 3 – Style	24
3.2. Conclusion	27
Chapter 4: Historically locating Emil Hartmann	29
4.1. The extent of Hartmann scholarship	29
4.1.1. Emil Hartmann (1836–1898)	29
4.2. The Classic Three (J.P.E. Hartmann, Gade and Nielsen) and other influences	30
4.2.1. Johan Peter Emelius Hartmann (1805–1900)	31
4.2.2. Niels Gade (1817–1890)	31
4.3. The Danish Golden Age: An unexplored musical treasure	32
4.3.1. Denmark in the 19 th century	32
4.3.2. Nationalism and the Nordic tone	36
4.3.3. Identifying the Nordic tone	37
4.4. Conclusion	38
Chapter 5: Locating the Nordic tone in op. 10	39

5.1. Folk influence	40
5.2. Static musical textures	50
5.2. Conclusion	53
Chapter 6: Discussion, Recommendations and Conclusion	55
6.2. Reflecting on the process	55
6.2.1. Practice-based research	56
6.2.2. Micro-history	56
6.2.3. Musical analysis	57
6.3. Weaving the narrative	57
6.4. Interpretational recommendations	60
6.4.1. Pedal points	60
6.4.2. The tremolos	61
6.4.3. Rubato	62
6.5. Conclusion	62
References	64
Addendum A: Questionnaire for participants	69
Addendum B: Video File (Extracts and Examples)	73

PART 1

Introduction and Approach

Chapter 1: Introduction

The past is dead and gone; history is what historians make of it.

Herbert *et al.*, 2003: 146

1.1. Background

This dissertation forms part of my master's degree in music. It is an integrated degree where performance (piano) and research each play an important role in the execution of the qualification. For the performative element of the degree I played two chamber recitals, one of which included a trio for violin, cello and piano (op. 10) by the Danish composer Emil Hartmann (1836–1898). Emil Hartmann is not a well-known composer and I soon realised that his life and music are largely unexplored, and that scholarship on Hartmann is almost non-existent.

With technology at our fingertips, information is always readily accessible. In music, there is a vast array of scores, historical research, textbooks and other musical materials which scholars and performers are able to access at any given point. Although the need for these sources may differ between various genres within the music field, in most instances, research is used as an essential part of a performers process of learning and understanding how to play a piece. This process of interpretive research is known as contextualisation and is common practice amongst performing artists. Without sufficient literature to guide the interpretational parameters of a performance, the creative process becomes experimental and based on embodied musical instinct and musical knowledge. In my opinion, this can detract from the musical and compositional intentions of the composer.

After conducting various unfruitful literature searches, online and in the university music library in order to find insight into Hartmann's life as a composer and musician, I was left in a position where contextualisation became a problem. I was not able to evaluate Hartmann's compositional intentions, nor was I able to contextualise meaning and influence within his composition. This was first-hand experience of not being able to access sufficient information on a composer and their life and I was solely reliant on the musical score for guidance. I became more intrigued to explore the work and the composer. Although this was a risky decision, I did not want to exclude Hartmann from the recital due to a lack of information, and was compelled to think about how a contextual understanding could be constructed without scholarly material. With a small body of geographical information from questionable sources (which will be interrogated later in this thesis), I set out to explore approaches to contextualising Hartmann's music.

1.2. Research aims

The overarching purpose of this study is to explore how one can generate knowledge of a lesser known composer in order to create a narrative to enhance the understanding and performance of a piece. This process highlights how contextualisation forms an integral part of musical interpretation and how a performer can begin to piece a context together in the absence of one. The research aims to explore the process of creating this narrative, using Emil Hartmann's piano trio op. 10 through building a micro-historical portrait of his life and work. To form this narrative, the research aims to use three complementary approaches with the score as the central musical artefact. Playing the work and reflecting on the score, performance and overall experience of a lesser known work lays the foundation for deepening the contextual understanding of the composition and composer. Following on from these practice-based reflections the research aims to use a micro-historical and analytical approach to construct a deeper narrative to enhance musical interpretation.

These aims can be summarised as follows:

- To explore the process of creating the narrative of a less researched composer in order to enhance musical interpretation, by:

- reflecting on the learning and performance of the work through a practice-based research style enquiry;
 - piecing together a narrative around Hartmann's life, as well as music in 19th century Denmark, using a micro-historical approach;
 - historically placing the score within the parameters of influence within 19th century Denmark through musical analysis.
- To critique the process of creating a narrative and comment on future interpretational approaches.

1.3. Chapter outline

The paper is divided into three parts in order to present the narrative as a whole, but also separated into chapters, according to their different methodological processes.

Part 1: Introduction and contextualisation:

Chapter 1 introduces the problem area, and highlights the meaning of contextualisation and why it is an important research process when learning music.

Chapter 2 highlights the methodological frameworks being implemented in this study, while providing an explanation for using a multi-methodological approach.

Part 2: Creating the narrative:

Chapter 3 focuses on practice-based research, by exploring embodiment of the trio for the practitioners through an online questionnaire. This section includes a personal observation on the work as one of the performers.

Chapter 4 pieces together a micro-historical perspective of 19th century Denmark, highlighting important historical movements in the socio-political systems, and their effects on musical life at the time. This chapter introduces key composers who were contemporaries of Emil Hartmann, and introduces the concept of the "Nordic tone". The latter half of this chapter highlights distinctive Nordic compositional trends and discusses them within the context of Hartmann's piano trio op. 10.

Chapter 5 discusses the Nordic tone in greater detail and introduces the analytical section. The discussions in this chapter place Emil Hartmann within the 19th century musical landscape in Denmark and explore nationalistic compositional trends within the work.

Part 3: Discussion and conclusion

Chapter 6 explores the methodological connections made in Part 2, discusses the process of creating the narrative on Hartmann and his op. 10 trio, as well as how my own interpretive approach has transformed over the period of this study.

Chapter 7 is the concluding chapter of this research, and provides a summary of the study, whilst discussing limitations and suggestions for further research.

1.4. Terminology

In this section I will explore the key terminology surrounding the concepts which will be explored in this research project.

Contextualisation

Eric Mackerness writes that contextualisation is a specific set of historical elements which affect the way a composition is formed and thus interpreted. These elements include social dynamics, political influences, nationality, culture, sexuality, and modernity (2013: 6). He continues “however skilful [the composer] may be in the craft of composition, [they] can do very little through the agency of mere notation” (2013: 6). Performers engage with these elements in order to prevent themselves from making reckless and inauthentic interpretive decisions within the performance space. It is therefore imperative that the performer consults relevant sources in order to explore the conventions which governed the music at the time of composition (Mackerness, 2013: 6-7). If one had to consider a Bach keyboard suite, an informed performer would refer to the historical context in which it was composed. The contextual research would inform the performer of the particular style period in which it was written, as well as providing insight into the historical practices which affect articulation, sound and interpretation of the work. In this scenario, there would be adequate research not only from a geographical standpoint of the composers global positioning, but the performer

would be able to access insight into Bach's life as a composer, and therefore use this information to further inform their interpretation.

Feld states that "Music has a fundamentally social life" (1984: 1). It can be interpreted in many ways, not only audibly, but intellectually, individually or communally. Its consumption is one of a symbolic nature and therefore it is to be interpreted "as meaningfully structured, produced, performed and displayed by varieties of prepared, or otherwise historically situated actors" (Leavy, 2020: 122). The main purpose of music contextualisation is to highlight and emphasise the repertoire, musical traditions, socio-political circumstances and cultural contexts through informed historical study (Cambridge University Press, 2019). As a procedure, historical contextualisation is used as a medium to create understanding between a historical artefact in the present day, rather than viewing it from a detached historical standpoint (Dalhaus, 1983: 5). Using J.S. Bach's St Matthew Passion (BWV 244) as an example, Dalhaus explains that although a significant amount of time lies between the present and the time of the composition, it is contextualisation which has informed our understanding of the work in the present day, and therefore enhanced the appreciation of the work (1983: 5).

Interpretation

Interpretation in music performance is the creation of understanding of the musical score and how you approach the execution of the notated music. This concept works hand in hand with the contextual parameters mentioned above, with contextualisation referring to the process of obtaining these parameters, and interpretation being the application of the information. Due to the nature of this study, explaining interpretation filters into the meaning of context. Levy states that it is the performer's intention to interpret the score and relay it to the listener, and therefore it is the duty of the performer to find context in order to interpret the work that is to be performed (Levy, 1995: 150). Laurence Dreyfus quotes Herman Danuser, who says that performers who undertake a systematic study before making interpretive decisions should be referred to as interpreters, rather than performers (Dreyfus, 2020: 3). Levy states that it is not possible for a performance to exist without interpretation. As a product on its own, a musical score cannot "speak for itself" and therefore the performance becomes an actualisation of an analytical act, even though such analysis may have been intuitive or unsystematic (Levy, 1995: 150). Musical scores function as a map, and exist beyond the score

itself. A performance of a work is the realisation of a piece as it contains additional interpretive features not present in the score. It is these interpretative devices that make the performance richer in value than what is presented solely on the score (Levy, 1995: 199). Therefore, the main feature of interpretation is to attach meaning and significance to the work, to make sense of a piece of music (Thom, 2003: 113). The performer must go beyond the score in order to successfully create meaning within the performance (2003: 134). In Thom's analogy, he describes the performer as an entity which is to adopt a persona and narrative identity in order to create presence and character to the music being performed (2003: 135).

Narrative and grand narrative

In this study I refer to the concepts of both narrative and grand narrative. Narrative refers to a set of events or experiences in relation to one-another. In the context of this study, the focus will be on grand narrative. The Encyclopaedia of Marxism (marxists.org, 2020) explains the grand narrative as, "an inner connection between events related to one another, a succession of social systems, the gradual development of social conditions, and so on". This means that the grand narrative focuses on events which contribute to the succession of movement within a specific discourse. Usually, and in the case of musicology, the grand narrative is inclusive of works, composers, geographical centres and political happenings which have predominantly had an effect on progression within the field. Composers such as Bach, Beethoven and Mozart (amongst others) are prime examples of composers who are included in this narrative.

1.5. Presentation of source material

Apart from Leavy (2020), Mackerness (2013) and Feld (1984) who have been vital in understanding the importance of the contextual nature of this research, the important literary sources and materials which have been used to form the contextual narrative being discovered in this thesis, are presented here.

Chapter 2 highlights three main theoretical frameworks: practice-led research, micro-historical research, and musical analysis. Hazel Smith and Roger Dean (2009), and Linda Candy and Ernest Edmonds (2018) have been notable contributors to the use of a practice-based research approach. They highlight how conclusive evidence and insights can be drawn from participatory interaction with the creative process. George Heller and Bruce Wilson (1982), alongside Susan Wyche, Phoebe Sengers and Rebecca Grinter (2006), contextualise the nature of historical research, however, more importantly Martin Clayton, Trevor Herbert, and Richard Middleton (2003) and Sigurður Magnússon and István Szijártó (2013), are important in highlighting the key aspects of this research, and how they relate to this study. White (1994) has provided insight into musical analysis, and substantiates the analysis section of the research by highlighting the importance of analysis as a method of tying performance and historical context together. The contributions of these researchers have emphasised the exclusion of Hartmann's narrative, and therefore the narratives of other comparatively unknown composers, and have provided a way for the research to bring Hartmann's story into the academic realm through a micro-historical lens.

Research on Danish musical history is minimal. Although this aspect of the project has been challenging there have been a number of sources which have been valuable in providing insight into this geographical space. The works of Lansing McLoskey (1998) and Dan Fog (1985) explore Danish musical history in the 19th century. More notably, Aksel Tollå's thesis (1906) has been an essential contribution to this study, focusing on Carl Nielsen's (1865-1931) opera *Maskarade*. Tollå's paper provides pertinent information into the socio-political events which affected the musical structures during this time, and has added valuable insight into the nationalistic tropes which affected the music.

In exploring Danish composers in the 19th century, literature on Johann Peter Emelius Hartmann (1805–1900), Emil Hartmann's father, and Niels Gade (1890–1870), his brother-in-law, have played a vital role in understanding the figureheads of Danish composers at the time, their contributions to musical life, and their compositional embodiment of the "Nordic tone" which will be expanded upon later in the paper. Research by Niels Krabbe (2005), Tim Howell (2019) and Michael Herman (n.d.), has provided insight into the compositional techniques these composers used, as well as the embodied Nordic tone, which persists in most of their compositions.

Providing a guide to thorough analytical theory in this research, Amanda Harris and Tim Howell have been important in breaking down the musical score and exploring the Nordic aesthetic in Hartmann's piano trio. Harris (2000) discusses Percy Grainger (1882–1961), an Australian composer and musicologist who was intrigued by Danish music. Through the lens of Grainger's music, Harris discusses Danish compositions, which has helped to provide analytical characteristics when looking at Hartmann's piano trio. Fjeldsøe and Groth and Torvinen and Välimäki in Howell (2019) provide a very useful analysis of Nordic characteristics in the work of Carl Nielsen, which has been essential in discovering the Nordic presence in Hartmann's compositional style. In recognising a relationship with the model of the folk-tune, Moulton (2005) discusses *Ossian*, a bard who recites epic tales, and uses the imagery of the bard to find representations of folk inspiration within a set of compositions. This information became an important part of the analytical process in finding the folk elements within Hartmann's trio op. 10.

1.6. Clarification

The essence of this research has been a task of digging up and uncovering knowledge from a limited number of sources. Due to this, not all sources used in this study are of peer reviewed material, and I have had to utilise additional less rigorous sources including websites, CD covers and discographies. However, to substantiate the use of these sources I will highlight their purpose within the research as well as their credibility within the context.

Exploring definitions and terms used in this research, I consulted Marxist.org as well as Encyclopedia.com. According to Sue Polanka, Encyclopedia.com is a research portal and compendium which contains information from verified sources, and is thus used by academics and scholars (Polanka, 2009: 80) Various other sources used to inform biographical details were extracted from reviews on featured recordings of Emil Hartmann and J.P.E. Hartmann's works, the CD, *Harmonious Families: Danish compositions by father and sons* (1998), alongside the liner notes from *Emil Hartmann: Nordic and German Songs* (2010) published by DANACORD records, a record label in Copenhagen which focuses on the dissemination of lesser known Danish classical music. I also refer to Naxos Music Library which is a popular music listening portal and, according to Yi Hong Sim, is associated with various tertiary

institution libraries (Sim, 2011: 89). As these sources are linked to recognisable industry labels, I believe that their inclusion within the research holds substantial credibility.

1.7. Conclusion

As a performer, it is common practice for me to consult contextual sources when preparing a work for performance. As Mackerness (2013) highlights, it is important for the performer to consult the relevant literature to prevent an inauthentic and reckless interpretation of the music. In this study, the contextual sources were inaccessible, leading to an uninformed interpretation of the work in performance. Therefore, through the lens of Emil Hartmann and his piano trio op. 10, the study aims to explore a contextualisation process which can be undertaken in order to add understanding to an unexplored narrative. The following chapter provides a set of methodological frameworks used to form Hartmann's narrative, and highlights the utilisation of these in the research.

Chapter 2: Methodology

The purpose of this chapter is to outline the methodological framework that will be used for this study. As the nature of the study is exploratory, I highlight that the research intention is not to create fact, but rather to suggest insight into the life of Emil Hartmann. Dalhaus says that “The historian must resist the deeply ingrained habit of thinking that the word ‘fact’ refers to something tangible since, to put it bluntly, a historical fact is nothing more than an hypothesis” (Dalhaus, 1983: 35). Barbara Bolt states that the construction of historical knowledge is unstable, ambiguous, and multidimensional and that its outcome can be influenced by emotion or affect and cannot be viewed as precise and as stable as a mathematical equation (in Barret and Bolt, 2007: 31). Despite these disclaimers, it is the aim, through this exploratory process, to highlight the importance of contextual analysis in informing interpretative decisions when approaching a musical work. This is ideal to do prior to performance. In this study, however, the performance came first. On one hand, the interpretative experience of the work could certainly have been strengthened with such prior understanding. On the other hand, working from the initial reflections, garnered by a post-performance questionnaire, has given me the opportunity, as one of the performers, to track how my view and interpretation of the work developed through deeper contextual understanding.

2.1. Theoretical framework

I have used a multi-methodological approach in order to create new knowledge on an under-researched topic. I considered what research methods could be used based on the musical score as an artefact, alongside the performative process undertaken by the musicians. In this instance, there are three forms of data being generated. Firstly, there is a practice-based interactive method, whereby performers use embodied understanding to reflect on the work. Secondly, there is a historical discovery of the socio-political circumstances and musical conventions which governed 19th century Denmark and influenced Hartmann as a composer. The third form of data generation is in the form of musical analysis. This collaborative approach aims to create a narrative around the musical work and composer, in order to

strengthen the performers' understanding and interpretation. The resultant narrative is reflected on to evaluate the process of creating such a historical portrait.

2.1.1. Practice-based research (PBR)

Leavy (2020: 4) states that ABR (arts-based research) *practices* are a set of methodological tools used by researchers across disciplines during any or all phases of research, including data generation, analysis, interpretation, and representation. These emerging tools adapt the tenets of the creative arts in order to address research questions in holistic and engaged ways in which theory and practice are intertwined. Representational forms include a variety of art forms such as short stories, novels, poems, paintings, drawings, sculpture, theatrical performances, musical performances, songs, and musical scores. This research focuses on two of these forms as the research basis, namely musical performance and musical score.

Practice-based research (PBR) forms part of a subsector of ABR, and plays a vital role in using the creative process as a means of knowledge production. This form of research is often referred to as practice-led research, practice-based research, creative research, or practice research, and these terminologies are used to describe the way a practitioner uses the creative process to form research insights (Smith and Dean, 2009: 3). PBR is usually used by practitioners such as artists, designers, curators, writers, musicians, teachers, and performers (Candy, 2006: 2).

Mareli Stolp writes that practice-based research has one core meaning: its purpose is to integrate research and practice, rather than separate these two concepts (Stolp, 2012: 80). She continues:

These two concepts ('practice' and 'research') traditionally existed in different ontological and epistemological realms. The researcher and the musical artist have in the past occupied two separate roles in the music discipline; what PBR envisages is that one person could fulfil both roles, facilitating a critical exchange between practice and theory and integrating these two seemingly disparate positions of performer and researcher within the academy.

The essence of this method provides an approach where researchers are able to form new insights around a given topic, allowing them to approach inaccessible areas and explore research questions in a new way. This form of research is particularly useful in aiming to "explore, discover, or unsettle" (Leavy, 2020: 22). PBR provides a space where scholarly rigour

and passion intercept, where the scholar and the artist are able to merge their practices through an integrated perspective (Leavy, 2020: 3). Smith and Dean (2009: 5) suggest that practice-led research can take two forms which often overlap:

- The creative work as an entity in itself is a form of research, and the researcher or practitioner is able to draw conclusions directly from that source;
- The specialised knowledge of the practitioners alongside the creative process can lead to research insights which can be used as research material.

Stolp expresses that PBR positions the performer centrally to the research as a reflexive entity which makes practice the basis of reflection and critique (Stolp, 2012: 80). It is the practitioner who uses performance as a means of knowledge generation, and forms insights into the problem area. Therefore, all players within the ensemble are important elements in guiding this research. Keith Swanwick explains that, on one hand, it is insufficient to study music as an entity in itself as if it were independent of musically knowing minds, and on the other hand we cannot base information only on the procedures of musicians (2002: 3). As researchers, listeners and performers, he states that to understand music requires us to think about music, how to perceive it and, most importantly, how we construe it (2002: 3). He discusses the link between the performers and the score, stating that the relationship between the creation of the composition and the creative process of the musicians forms the basis of musical knowledge. He continues, “The two coordinates of this transaction are the nature and quality of musical knowledge itself and sensitivity in understanding other people as they respond to music as music-makers and music-takers in a cultural context” (Swanwick, 2002: 3).

It is this process of the practitioners’ interactions with the artefact – in this case the musical score – as well as their own embedded knowledge, that is to be examined and analysed. Fog mentions that the musical score is an important research tool. He says, “It carries weight in studies of history of church and school, drama and dance literature and poetry, social and cultural phases, etc.” (Fog, 1985: 35). Candy and Edmonds say that in order for the knowledge generated to make a valuable and solid contribution, it is the embodied knowledge, alongside the artefact, which can be seen as the research outcome (Candy and Edmonds, 2018: 66). This means that the score as artefact cannot stand alone without a contextual explanation and therefore it is the process of the interaction between the practice and the artefact which subsequently generates knowledge (Candy and Edmonds, 2018: 67). As a means of

interrogating the micro-context in this study, I have used PBR as an initial tool of exploration. The approach of PBR in this study was to set the foundation for how the Hartmann trio is interpreted before a micro-historical narrative is developed.

2.1.2. Micro-history

As a large part of creating this narrative is of a historical nature, it is important to start by giving a brief explanation of historical research. Leonard Meyer states that history in its entirety is not only a string of information in chronological order, but also it is a method of connecting documents, events, and actions that form logical patterns in time (1996: 70). Heller and Wilson (1982: 3) describe it as a systematic investigation with discoveries made through the lenses of people, traditions, social structures, and institutions of learning. In essence, historical researchers review historical texts, newspapers and other historical material in order to form conclusions on social discourses at a specific time (Wyche *et al.*, 2006: 37-38).

This research will be analysing the historical context of 19th century Denmark. As this geographical area does not form a prominent part of mainstream musicology, it can be seen as being excluded from the grand narrative, as mentioned before. Zooming into the life of a composer who was not a part of the grand narrative, means that this research is micro-historical in its approach. Trevor Herbert (2003) explains that this form of research is of postmodernist¹ ideology. Herbert goes on to say that postmodernist research focuses its approach on the themes and practices which lie beyond the traditional parameters of historical methodology and thus can be classified as micro-history² (Herbert in Clayton, Herbert and Middleton, 2003: 151-152). Magnússon and Szijártó explain that micro-historians view history through the lens of a microscope rather than a telescope (2013: 4). Thus, the research focuses closely on small, but important, facts which contribute to the larger whole.

¹ Postmodernism “can be described as a set of critical, strategic and rhetorical practices employing concepts such as difference, repetition, the trace, the simulacrum, and hyperreality to destabilize other concepts such as presence, identity, historical progress, epistemic certainty, and the univocity of meaning” (Aylesworth, 2015).

² “Microhistory is a historical method that takes as its object of study the interactions of individuals and small groups with the goal of isolating ideas, beliefs, practices, and actions that would otherwise remain unknown by means of more conventional historical strategies.” (Appuhn, 2020).

According to Magnussen and Szijártó (2013: 5), we are able to conceive of microhistory in three ways:

1. Microhistory focuses on specific cases, persons, and circumstances through an intensive historical study. This study creates a focal point of collecting various data from the past.
2. Microhistory is not merely a case study: it searches for great historical questions while studying small, specific objects.
3. Microhistory believes that people from the past were not merely inactive participants in the greater forces which dominate history, they were all a part of the makeup of history.

Often, a micro-historian cannot directly observe, interact, or interview the primary source that is being studied. However, their responsibility is to find new and innovative ways of obtaining evidence and archival history so they will accumulate small pieces of information which will eventually aid them in assembling data into coherent models, from which they can draw broader conclusions (Appuhn, 2020). Herbert writes that microhistories take the opposite tack to the large-scale, grand narrative approach that deals with major themes running over several centuries. He quotes Evans where he says, “they build on the obscure and unknown rather than on the great and the famous... [They] take very small incidents in everyday life and retell them as stories, analysing them as metaphorical and symbolic clues to larger things” (Herbet in Clayton, Herbert and Middleton, 2003: 152). Thus, they often disclose something of the relationship between the popular and the elite so as to inform a wider historical picture (Herbert in Clayton, Herbert and Middleton., 2003: 152).

Magnússon and Szijártó state that often studies of historical artefacts are bound by finding meaning in written sources, and cannot learn more about the past than what is already known. It is imperative that the scholar makes use of different approaches in order to come nearer to their desired goal (Magnússon and Szijártó, 2013: 6).

2.1.3. Musical analysis

In order to view Hartmann’s composition within a musically historical context, there is a need for a musical analysis of the work. White (1994) explains that the musicologist/music historian

uses analytical methodology to understand the history of musical style (White, 1994: vii). White highlights the importance of analysis with regard to performance and contextual study, which speaks directly to the process of creating a narrative such as in this mini-thesis. He explains that performers embark on an analytical process in order to obtain optimal performance, and historians use this process to understand the musical style, and place it within history (White, 1994: 1) White (1994: 1) continues:

Sometimes the analytical process is instinctive or tacit, as in the case of a chamber group in rehearsal carrying on discussions about tempos, dynamics, and nuances within the course of a composition – often they are unaware that the judgments they are making are in the domain of musical analysis.

Adorno and Paddison (1982) explain that the performer or interpreter needs to get to know a work intimately, stating that for a performer to know a work, they must undertake an analytical process which informs the interpretation of the work (Adorno and Paddison, 1982: 171). Their comments highlight the importance of the analytical method and how it functions hand in hand with the historical and performative element. White explains that analysis is a tool which aids in comparisons, distinctions, judgments and forming enlightening conclusions about music – its creation, its existence, and its performance (White, 1994: 3).

Musical analysis as a method concerns itself with the identifying of musical elements within a set of parameters including rhythm³, melody⁴, harmony⁵ and sound⁶. White explains that these parameters each function in conjunction with each other, and cannot be separated as entities on their own (White, 1994: 21).

2.2. Method

As described above, three methods are used to create a historical and musical understanding of the composer. The research is structured in a manner which provides a layered approach where insights are gathered to build upon each methodological approach.

The research begins with the practice-based section of the paper (Chapter 3) recording the experience of the performers who learnt Hartmann's op. 10 piano trio, obtained through

³ Includes elements of durations, accents, tempos and meters (White, 1994: 21)

⁴ Includes elements such as pitch, rhythm, dynamics and timbre (White, 1994: 21)

⁵ Includes chords, harmonic and tonal relationships, and harmonic structures (White, 1994: 21).

⁶ Refers to timbre, texture and dynamics (White, 1994: 21).

online questionnaires. As a trio consists of three practitioners, my personal observations, based on my own experiences of the creative process, were also recorded. With the musical score as the primary artefact and only definitive source within this study, themes were recognised and used to question the participants, Zanta Hofmeyr (violin) and Susan Mouton (cello). The emergent themes emanate from the embodied knowledge of all three performers in order to gain an understanding of their experience of the music prior to contextual understanding. Candy and Edmonds explain that it is the creative engagement with the musical score which aims to place it within a context (2018: 66). In order to inform the context, PBR uses reflections on the creative work, which, coupled with research, is used to provide viable research material. The questions which are derived from practice are used to form a dialogue between the practice and the research (Nimkulrat, 2007: 3). In this study, the participants were provided with a questionnaire (Addendum A) which was designed to elicit certain responses based on the creative process. The themes presented in the questionnaire were:

- 1) Subjective reflection on the overall emotional quality of the work;
- 2) Musical opinions of structural, harmonic, and theoretical proficiency of the composition; and
- 3) A comparative analysis of the trio in comparison to contemporary compositions; observations on technical characteristics within the composition.

The questions stated in Addendum A were critically examined in order to explore the themes mentioned above. With these responses, the themes were analysed in order to form insights based on the embodied knowledge of the participants as well as to provide direction for the next process of the research. The PBR was strategically placed in Chapter 4 in order to explore the need for a contextual process to take place, as well as a way of creating insightful observations when coupled with other forms of research methodology.

The next phase of the research builds on the PBR through an exploration of 19th century Danish history (Chapter 4). As it is not a prominent geographical centre within Western Art Music literature, this section forms the micro-historical part of this paper. In order to formulate an understanding of Hartmann's place as a composer within the historical narrative, this section engages with literature which explores the socio-political circumstances which encircled Denmark at the time. It highlights important movements in

politics and historical happenings which filtered into musical life and composition. Key concepts are introduced for themes such as the development of the important musical figures, folk tunes, nordicism in music, and nationalism. This is important in locating Hartmann geographically in order to create a deeper understanding of the context in which he was composing. Placing the micro-historical section after the PBR sought to highlight certain themes which emerged from the embodied knowledge of the practitioners, and therefore are used to add to the formation of the contextual findings.

Guided by the micro-historical chapter, the analysis sought to interrogate the themes discovered through applying the previous methods. Through an analytical method of examining the structural elements of Hartmann's piano trio op. 10, the musical analysis section (Chapter 5) used the themes based on Chapter 4 to locate the Nordic character within the composition. The analysis explored the use of melodic, harmonic, structural and rhythmic elements within the piano trio op. 10 in order to locate the composition within its context.

Finally, the research reflects on the process of using the multi-methodological approach, by highlighting the contextual process undertaken through the lens of creating Emil Hartmann's narrative. Through this process, a narrative was constructed, by connecting the themes found within each methodological process.

2.3. Conclusion

The three-pronged methodological approach mentioned in this chapter provides a framework in which the contextual process will take form. In using practice-based research, micro-history and musical analysis together, each layer aims to provide insightful observations to the narrative being uncovered.

Part 2 employs the methodological approaches mentioned above to construct a narrative surrounding Hartmann's life.

PART 2:

CREATING THE NARRATIVE

This section of the research seeks to use the three methodological approaches mentioned in Chapter 2 to map out the contextual exploration of Emil Hartmann and his piano trio op. 10. The formation of this section can be identified as building blocks which add the layers of context towards the creation of this narrative and thus, when working together, form insight into the problem area.

[Please refer to the URL/QR code in Addendum B when reference is made to a video file in parts 2 and 3.]

Chapter 3: Practice-Based Research

Hartmann's piano trio op. 10 is the composition at the core of creating this narrative. As this work is presented as a trio (violin, cello and piano) it has, by nature, three contributing practitioners involved within the creative process. The violinist and cellist are both professional musicians, highly educated and experienced, and are both held in high regard as educators and performers, nationally and internationally. As these musicians have engaged with many varied musical endeavours in their careers, their contribution to this study is of great worth, and their reflections of playing the Hartmann piano trio will add valuable and important insights.

3.1. Observations: Practice based in action

This section critically engages with the practitioners' engagements with the creative process of learning the Hartmann piano trio, Op. 10. I compiled a list of twelve questions via an online

questionnaire (see Addendum A) aimed at gaining a deeper understanding of the creative process. The themes and questions in the online questionnaire were purposely chosen to interrogate the research area, and aid in creating insight into Hartmann's narrative.

In this chapter, I use the responses generated from the questionnaires based on their observations on the creative process of learning Hartmann's trio op. 10. The questionnaire responses are presented under three themes: instrumentation, influence and style, which are derived out of the structure of the questionnaire. After introducing each theme, the performer's comments are summarised separately and then discussed together to highlight the patterns discovered. At this stage of the research the performers are relating to the trio from a purely performance-based perspective with no historical knowledge or insight. This is worth highlighting because the responses in this section partly inform the need for deeper research, as well as the methods chosen for this.

3.1.1. Theme 1 – Instrumentation

The piano trio op. 10 is a work of high virtuosic level and all instruments need to function on an equal plane technically and interpretively. The trio makes use of extensive conversational interaction between the three instruments, such as melodic motifs⁷, and interlinks various dominant phrases between them. All three instruments play a dominant role at various points, as well as all playing accompaniment-like passages to support each other.

Response by string players

During the rehearsals, as well as in the questionnaire, a common topic was the comfortability of the string sections. Both string players mentioned that although the work is technically challenging, it is very comfortably written for their instruments in terms of accessibility and positioning of passages. Mouton described the work as being "very cellistic" and suggested that due to the kinetic comfort of the work, Hartmann himself could have possibly been a cellist, or have been in close contact with a cellist while composing (Mouton, 2020). She also highlighted that much thematic material is given to the cello, and that the instrument often

⁷ A small structural unit possessing thematic material (White, 1994: 62).

opens the thematic material or the movement. This statement was supported by Hofmeyr, who highlighted that the strings play a very prominent role in terms of melodic dominance and that there is a constant dialogue (as seen in Extract A) between the two string instruments (Hofmeyr, 2020).

The image shows a musical score for the first movement of Hartmann's Piano Trio op. 10, page 5. It features two staves: the top staff is for the violin and the bottom staff is for the cello. The violin part begins with the instruction 'a tempo' and the cello part with 'p dolce e cantabile' and 'a tempo'. A box labeled 'Theme 1' points to the first measure of the cello part, and a box labeled 'Echo of Theme 1' points to the first measure of the violin part. The page number '5' is in the top right corner.

Extract A [video file, 02:23]: Hartmann, Piano Trio op. 10, 1st mov., page 5 (Cello [second line] states the theme, followed by the violin's [top line] echo of the same theme)

Hofmeyr also commented positively on the writing of the violin score, finding it “extremely well written for the violin” and explained that the passages fit into the “violin hand” organically. Later in the questionnaire Mouton commented on the bowing techniques and again suggested the possibility of Hartmann being a cellist. She commented, “it really does lie well on the cello, and the cello is given many of the thematic materials” (Mouton, 2020).

Personal reflection

My own observation of the piano section was experienced differently. I found that the music is not comfortable for the pianist, and frequently the stretches and passage work are unusual to the piano hand (see Extract B). Often the dynamics felt difficult to control due to their placement on the piano, they can be difficult to execute. A notable area would be when the composer requests a broad bass section to be played *pianississimo* (see Extract C).

Extract B: Hartmann, Piano Trio op. 10, 1st mov., page 8 (chords which exceed the stretch of an octave [Bars 7 & 12], not facilitated by rolled or separation figures)

Extract C: Hartmann, Piano Trio op. 10, 2nd mov., page 5 (Tremolos in *ppp* [Bars 1-6])

Themed summary

There are various conclusive insights which we can draw upon here. From the string players' comments, it is possible to assume that Hartmann was a string player, and a highly skilled one at that. Although the writing for the piano section may not be as comfortable as the string parts, the piano section still holds a dominant and impressive role within the composition. It leads me to believe that Hartmann was not first and foremost a pianist, as he had taken up a position as an organist in his lifetime and thus had some insight into keyboard playing (this is addressed in Chapter 4 under the micro-historical discussion). Considering the difference

between the pianoforte and the organ, it is possible that the strange stretches, as well as dynamic issues that were encountered in the piano part could be as a result of this. The organ and piano have differing approaches to touch as well as sound production, and I believe that he approached this trio in a very organistic way. He also employs large amounts of pedal points within the composition, which are not only very reminiscent of the Nordic characteristic of the music (discussed in Chapter 5 under the analysis action), but also serves as a common compositional technique for organ players.

3.1.2. Theme 2 – Influence

Upon hearing the work for the first time, the trio displays characteristics of the conventional Romantic period trio of the 19th century. The composition has many long lines, full textures, and lyrical melodies all of which enhance the Romantic quality of the music. However, when working closely with the music there is a feeling that there are other influences in the trio that add to the unique quality of the music, which is explored in the analysis chapter below (Chapter 5).

Response by string players

Both string players stated that they had minimal musical engagement with music by Danish composers. Mouton had engaged with the works of Carl Nielsen, one of the best-known Danish composers of the 19th and early 20th century (discussed further in Chapter 5) (Mouton, 2020). With her experience of Nielsen's compositions, she highlighted that she did not find any similarity between Nielsen's work and the Hartmann trio. She did, however, comment on the European presence within the music, stating that the trio contains similar characteristics to that of traditional 19th century trios. She wrote, "It is certainly very Romantic in character, which was typical of that time period" (Mouton, 2020).

Hofmeyr also shared this view on the work, stating that it is of a high Romantic quality (Hofmeyr, 2020). She associated the broodiness of the introductions of the 1st and 4th movements as characteristic of the Romantic personality of the tragic hero. One of the examples she referred to was Cyrano de Bergerac, a character from a play written by Edmond

Rostand. She also referred to Franz Schubert's song cycle *Winterreise* and *Lieder eines fahrenden Gesellen* by Gustav Mahler. She explained this concept as:

dreams and disappointments so intricately woven together, forming real moments of joy and also depths of disappearance which ultimately makes up the sum total of life. All of that can best be expressed through music which can express the inexpressible (Hofmeyr, 2020).

When asked to compare Hartmann's op. 10 trio to other contemporary works of that time, she drew associations to the trios of Mendelssohn, Schubert lieder and Schumann piano trios, stating that this trio followed conventional 19th century compositional elements developed by Ludwig von Beethoven and Felix Mendelssohn. Notably, Hofmeyr commented that the trio reminded her of violin sonatas of Louis Spohr (1784–1859). In Section 4.1. I elaborate on the fact that Emil Hartmann's father, Johann Peter Emilius Hartmann, was actually influenced by Spohr. Although Debussy was a successor of Hartmann, she related the trio's structure as to that of Debussy's trio in G major, which also places the Scherzo as the second movement, rather than the convention of the second movement being the slow movement and scherzo as the third movement.

Personal reflection

My personal experience with Danish composers is well informed. As it is a passion of mine to explore little known repertoire within the vast shelf of musical works and composers, I have explored and listened to many Danish composers. In my opinion, 19th century Danish music, although often conventional in its form and style, encompasses an undefined sonic presence which I was not able to articulate before. I constantly found myself being drawn to this music and searching for more Danish repertoire to add to my list of composers. This specific trio stood out to me from the first time I heard it, and I was immediately attracted to the accessibility of the music. I also strongly felt the 19th century Romanticism within the trio, and a lyricism akin to that of Frédéric Chopin (1810–1849). Notably, the very Romantic, lyrical melodic line with the arpeggiated left hand accompaniment specifically stands out to me and is especially prominent in the *Andante* section in movement 3 (see Extract D).



Extract D [video file 07:04]: Hartmann, Piano Trio op. 10, 3rd mov., page 25 (stylistic similarity to Chopin)

Themed summary

When analysing the performers' interactions with Danish music, it is immediately apparent that Danish compositions do not feature much in the classical music canon in South Africa. Considering the active performance careers of both the string players, neither of them have had much exposure to Danish music. Both string players have made connections between Hartmann's piano trio and other Romantic composers emanating from Europe. Indeed, it is possible that much 19th century Danish music was highly influenced by European ideals, and undoubtedly this was the case in the work of Hartmann. These connections are explored further in Chapter 4.

3.3.3. Theme 3 – Style

Leading on from the above discussion about influences, this section explores the performers' personal interpretation of the style of the work, within the realm of the Romantic piano trio genre.

Response by string players

Both string players immediately responded well to the stylistic elements of the Hartmann trio. They commented on the pleasure of playing such highly Romantic music, and highlighted that

the technical quality of the work was of equal weight throughout. Mouton commented on the fact that the music was extremely accessible to herself as a performer, and she felt that the thematic material used, notably in the opening phrases of the cello themes, allowed the audience to immediately relax into the music and enjoy it (Mouton, 2020). Hofmeyr also highlighted the return of thematic material, specifically the reintroduction of the opening theme from the 1st movement which is reintroduced in the opening of the 4th movement (Hofmeyr, 2020).

Harmonically, both players reacted positively to the work, although their opinions differed slightly on this topic. Mouton felt that the trio contained various unusual harmonic material, which she suggested could be the Danish influence (Mouton, 2020). On the other hand, Hofmeyr felt that the harmonic material was similar to conventional 19th century Romantic writing, again closely comparing the trio to the writing of Robert Schumann (1810–1856) and Felix Mendelssohn (1809–1847) (Hofmeyr, 2020). She did however highlight the brooding emotional quality of the music, stating that Hartmann's use of changing harmonic quality, shifting from B flat minor to B flat major, particularly stood out to her.

On the whole, both players felt that the music was technically and musically accessible. They commented that the trio was enjoyable to play, and that it contained emotional depth, compositional complexity and technical proficiency equal to that of its contemporaries.

Personal reflection

I was immediately attracted to Hartmann's trio because of the lyrical quality of the music. Often when I first listen to a work I do not immediately connect with it, but in the case of this trio it had an immediate effect and felt familiar and accessible. As mentioned in the previous discussion, I had been exposed to other little known Danish composers, and I found similarities in the Hartmann trio to the other Danish compositions of that period. Once I had listened to the full work I became aware of an element within the music that I identified as a folk-like element, especially in the rapid dance-like character of the scherzo. I again noticed this in the small scherzo section (see Extract E) in the middle of the 4th movement. The varying moods throughout the work stood out to me, ranging from intense dramatism to sensitive lyrical moments, which echoes sentiments described by the violinist and cellist.

Extract E [video file 08:47]: Hartmann, Piano Trio op. 10, 4th mov, page 34 (folk-like character)

Another observation that I made was Hartmann's use of the instruments to make various folk-like effects. From the introduction in the 1st movement he places rolled chords in the accompaniment (see Example 1 in Chapter 5) which begin on the second beat of the bar. These initially seemed misplaced and uncomfortable to the stretch of the hand. Another notably effective passage was the flourish by the piano which features at the end of the introduction section in the 1st movement. Here the piano plays an arpeggiated glissando-type roll from either extreme of the keyboard (see Extract F), which creates a misty sound. This is induced by the speed of the notes as well as the *pp* dynamic marking and his indication to use the *una corda*⁸.

Extract F [video file 02:12]: Hartmann, Piano Trio op. 10, 1st mov., page 4 (arpeggiated glissando)

Another use of effects employed by Hartmann was his use of the plucked chords in Extract G which enhance the dance-like quality of the *Scherzo*. During the rehearsal process these

⁸ The pedal located on the far left of the piano which enables the pianist to reach a softer dynamic level.

chords employed by the violinist immediately caught my attention and were particularly effective above the folk-like melody played by the piano.

Extract G: Hartmann, Piano Trio op. 10, 2nd mov., page 4 (plucked chords in violin voice [Bars 3-5 Pizz.]

Lastly, throughout the work Hartmann repeatedly creates a dark sound, similar to the rumbling of thunder at the bottom register of the piano. He creates this by employing tremolos (similar to Extract C) in the formation of an octave which resonates for substantial lengths of time, while often highlighting melodic material in the higher registers.

Themed summary

The group was able to access the music emotionally, while still feeling challenged and fulfilled technically. The string players had varying opinions on Hartmann's use of harmonic material. Hofmeyr felt that the harmonies were equal to contemporary writing of the 19th century, while Mouton noticed unusual harmonic progressions which she felt could be of Nordic influence. Both these contrasting ideas on the compositional elements of the trio will be discussed in the following chapters.

3.2. Conclusion

Chapter 3 sought to use the creative process undertaken by all three participants when learning the Hartmann piano trio op. 10, and to discover emergent themes based on their responses. As highlighted above, all performers successfully related to the compositional material, and therefore enjoyed the creative process of learning the music. With a thorough

exploration and analysis of the responses of the players, the PBR highlights common ties to the conventional 19th century Romantic trios, although it highlights the need to produce new contextual material in order to carefully examine the trio in question. This knowledge will be re-analysed in Chapter 6 to present significant findings.

The next chapter seeks to use a micro-historical approach to explore 19th century, Danish musical society, and thus create further understanding based on the responses of the participants.

Chapter 4: Historically locating Emil Hartmann

This chapter sets out to map the socio-political circumstances in which Emil Hartmann lived. The small body of Hartmann scholarship available below is the basis on which I begin the historical discovery, thereafter commenting on the recorded state of 19th century Denmark. Alongside these social and political details, is an investigation of important composers and musical figures in Scandinavia and Europe who played active roles in the influence of Danish music from that time. As White explains, composers will often harbour close relationships with their contemporaries, historical period, school, or movement (1994: 5).

4.1. The extent of Hartmann scholarship

As stated, during the initial library and online search for information on Emil Hartmann, there was minimal writing available about him. Therefore, the sources used in this section are not all traditionally accepted academic material, and even then, contain only limited amounts of information on Hartmann's life. The purpose of this section serves as a starting point to create a micro-historical lens by highlighting biographical and geographical details centred around, if not specifically about, his life.

4.1.1. Emil Hartmann (1836–1898)

Emil Hartmann was born in Copenhagen, Denmark, on 1st February 1836, into a family immersed in musical culture. The Hartmann family name provides at least four generations of composers, with various siblings, wives and in-laws who were also active music-makers (France, n.d.). Unsurprisingly, considering his extensive musical family, it is apparent that Hartmann was a gifted musician. He was the son of Johan Peter Emilius Hartmann (1805–1900) who was a leading Danish composer of his time (discussed further in Section 4.2.1. below). Through his father, Emil Hartmann began his music tuition at a young age and was exposed to many aspects of musical life. Hartmann appears to have been a musical prodigy, and was able to compose before he was able to speak properly (Naxos.com, 2019).

In his adult years Emil Hartmann was employed as an organist at St Johannes Church in Nørrebro and later at Christiansborg Slotskirke in Denmark, a position he maintained until his

death on 18th July 1898. Although he had only one occupation, he travelled frequently and was subsequently able to visit musical centres such as Berlin, Dresden, Leipzig, Paris and Vienna for studying purposes. With experience, Hartmann realised that works based on Scandinavian folk melodies were well received at the time and he therefore tried to popularise these melodies by expanding on his father's already inherent "Nordic tone" (Emil Hartmann: Nordic and German Songs, 2010). Hartmann's father and his brother-in-law, Niels W. Gade (1817–1890), were already prominent musical figures in Denmark, and despite his active compositional career, Hartmann was often overlooked as a prominent composer.

4.2. The Classic Three (J.P.E. Hartmann, Gade and Nielsen) and other influences

The popularity of J.P.E. Hartmann, alongside Niels W. Gade overshadowed Hartmann's compositional aspirations. Krabbe (2005: 117-118) says:

Niels Wilhelm Gade, Johann Peter Emilius Hartmann, and Carl Nielsen. If one were to ask any musically interested layman in Denmark to mention the three most important national composers of the past, these three names would undoubtedly come to mind in most, if not all, cases. One could say they are the "classic three", almost on the same level from a local perspective as the great triumvirate of Haydn, Mozart and Beethoven seen from an international perspective

As Hartmann's contemporaries held prominent positions in Denmark's grand narrative, as well as considering the close relations he harboured with both J.P.E. Hartmann and Niels W. Gade, it is possible that they would have been influential in his life as a composer. It is therefore imperative that the research positions these composers in relation to Emil Hartmann in order to trace common approaches within their compositional styles. More specifically the research will highlight the use of the Nordic characteristic which appears as a common theme within the compositional style of Hartmann's contemporaries, and thereafter seek to locate it within the trio op. 10. Considering Denmark inhabits an intimate musical circle, these composers would have undoubtedly been of great influence within the compositional circuit. Carl Nielsen is not one of Hartmann's direct contemporaries, as their lives only overlap briefly, therefore I will not include him in this chapter.

4.2.1. Johan Peter Emelius Hartmann (1805–1900)

Johann Peter Emelius Hartmann was born on 14th May 1805 in Copenhagen, Denmark. J.P.E. Hartmann also came from a musical family. His father Johann Ernest Hartmann was a skilled composer, and from a young age J.P.E. Hartmann was tutored in music and composition (France, n.d.). After the initial tuition provided by his father, J.P.E. Hartmann was mentored by well-known composers Christoph Ernst Friedrich Weyse (1774–1842) and Louis Spohr (1784–1859) (Herman, n.d.: 43). As his compositional career began to grow, so did his social status within the Danish musical circle. His increased stature eventually resulted in his appointment as director of music at the Conservatory in Copenhagen during which time he toured various European countries. According to Krabbe, J.P.E. was in fact better known for his social stature, friendships, connections and influence rather than his work as a composer (2005: 5).

J.P.E. Hartmann composed a vast amount of repertoire and focused much of his attention on ballets, instrumental music and chamber music (Herman, n.d.: 43). His musical style developed over the period of his life while his earlier compositional style was ingrained in a more Germanic-conventional quality with a lack of originality and identity. Later in his life he began to develop a strong nationalistic “Nordic tone” (to be discussed in Section 4.3.5.), also referred to as “old Norse”, and began to find a sense of personal identity within his compositions (Krabbe, 2005: 5; Day, 2020: 171).

4.2.2. Niels Gade (1817–1890)

Niels Gade was born in Copenhagen, Denmark. He trained as a violinist and theorist, eventually becoming one of the leading composers in Danish music history. He had strong connections with Felix Mendelssohn, working as his assistant conductor in Leipzig (Herman, n.d.: 31). His compositional output is vast and includes styles such as ballets, cantatas, orchestral works, vocal music, concertos and symphonies. Gade was a particularly important historical figure in Danish music as he embodied the sonic quality of the “Nordic tone” (Krabbe, 2005: 118). Gade’s “Nordic tone” and national musical sound developed at the time when nationalistic music was gaining popularity in Germany, which translated to Gade finding favour as a nationalistic Danish composer. It was this increased sense of national identity, belonging and self-understanding that contributed to Gade’s rise (Krabbe, 2005: 118).

4.3. The Danish Golden Age: An unexplored musical treasure

These brief sections on Niels Gade and Johann Peter Emilius Hartmann highlight a common nationalistic presence which persisted in both of their compositional styles. By engaging with the Nordic presence in their work, their narratives resonate with the inherent Nordic characteristics which will be explored in this section, which will also explore the socio-political circumstances surrounding 19th century Denmark, in order to place him and his contemporaries within the context in which they were composing.

Anna Hersey (2016) states that Danish music is predominantly unknown outside of its home country, and that although it does not feature in the traditional canon, it should not be dismissed or forgotten. McLoskey concurs and writes,

Something is weird in the state of Denmark. The king rides a bicycle, and the density of musical composers per square kilometer exceeds that of all other countries. Something weird indeed. In a country of little more than five million people there is an inordinate amount of musical activity... Yet, for all the vitality in Danish musical life, Danish music remains in a state of relative obscurity outside of Scandinavia, even among those in the fields of compositions and musicology. (McLoskey, 1998: preface)

The relative obscurity of Denmark's musical presence, even though it was a productively musical country with many active composers, makes research challenging. Therefore, in order to gain a better understanding, it is imperative to explore Denmark as a country in the 19th century.

4.3.1. Denmark in the 19th century

Musical style and compositional trends are inherently linked with political and historical events. Beginning in 18th century Denmark, Tollå (2019) highlights the initial development of the nationalistic movement in music in that country. This period saw an increased interest in Germanic languages and literature based on folk-tales and folklore. During the latter half of the 18th century King Christian VII fell ill, and as a result was unable to continue his reign. This resulted in one of the statesmen, Ove Høegh-Guldberg, taking over as ruler. Høegh-Guldberg's ideologies were based on conservative, nationalistic structures which subsequently filtered into the arts and music (Tollå, 2019: 21). This movement within the political structure promoted Danish national discourses and began to portray Danish people

in a more dramatic and heroic light. The first account of Emil Hartmann's ancestry was seen during this half of the 18th century. The music of Johann Ernest Hartmann (1770–1844) was considerably influenced by the nationalistic movement imposed by Høegh-Guldberg and this can be seen in the use of folk influences in his compositions (Tollå, 2019: 22).

Agricultural reform began in the 1780s, and promoted freedom from enslavement as well as movement and ownership of land. The reactions to these changes soon filtered into musical ideology which was reflected in plays and Singspiele⁹ which were held at the Royal Theatre in Copenhagen. During this time of change and reform, an important figure emerged in the development of 19th century Danish music. Johann Abraham Peter Schulz (1747–1800), who originated from Germany, composed a Singspiel, *Høstgildet* (Harvest Festival), which was an ideal example of the reactions against the reform which was taking place (Tollå, 2019: 22). The plot revolves around a *selvejerbonde* (a farmer who owns his own land), whose two daughters end up marrying their suitors: a Norwegian former royal guardsman, and a sailor from Holstein (Tollå, 2019: 22). The *Singspiel* was written and premiered for a royal occasion, the marriage between Crown Prince Frederick and his cousin Marie Sophie. *Høstgildet* stresses the unity of Denmark, with the characters from all around the Danish realm engaged. Recognition of the king is invoked through one of the suitors being a former royal guardsman, but also through the praise levelled at the agricultural reforms, and not least the final chorus explicitly praising the king. Schulz's music was widely considered to be particularly Danish, with a mix of songs, choruses and dances (Tollå, 2019: 21).

Although Schulz was of German origin, he managed to firmly root himself within Danish musical society, eventually becoming appointed as the Royal Kapellmeister in Copenhagen in 1787. He became a well-known composer of operettas, *Singspiele* and songs (Tollå, 2019: 23). Schulz's musical style was influenced by the German folk song. This genre was not classified as folk song at the time, but did, however, imitate the simplicity and timelessness of the folk tradition. As Schulz was progressively immersing himself into Danish society, his popularity began to grow as a musical figure. He became the pioneer for combining elements of simplicity and primitive musical accompaniments with inspirations from the Neapolitan operas within his own compositions. As a result of this, he became the vision of a Danish national figure, and his compositional style became recognised as traditionally Danish.

⁹ A form of German light opera, typically with spoken dialogue, popularised in the late 18th century.

Importantly, the musical traits of these compositions consist of popular and simple melodies and easy harmonic movements in order to promote accessibility and familiarity, which was achieved through diatonicism, and repetitive melodic and rhythmic figures became essential to the vision of this style, which persisted well into the first half of the 19th century (Tollå, 2019: 24).

At the start of the 19th century, Denmark suffered damaging losses due to the Napoleonic wars. The results of these attacks were catastrophic, and resulted in the burning down of the capital, loss in population, changing of union with certain countries, as well as changes in political structures (Stewart, 2015). Jens Koudal states that as a result of the loss suffered within the Napoleonic wars, there was a need to preserve old Danish culture. Consequently, the upper class of Denmark began searching for ways to return to a more authentic Danish culture, including an effort to form an archive of folk melodies from the peasantry or lower class of Denmark (1993: 101). This movement increased the nationalistic response from society and therefore in Danish-born composers (Tollå, 2019: 26).

With this increased nationalistic interest, Danish-born composers such as Gade, and J.P.E. Hartmann became well-known musical figures in Danish life (Tollå, 2019: 27). J.P.E. Hartmann, specifically, as the composer of the operas *Fiskerne* and *Linden Kirsten*, based his compositional elements strongly on Danish national trends, using Danish folkloric tales which drew ideas from Danish scenery, and, the influence of the Germanic strophic song. These ideologies of “Danishness” and Danish national identity are reminiscent of Danish environmental imagery – rolling hills, humble Danish farmers and vast forests (Tollå, 2019: 18). In fact, it was not only the Euro-Romantic return to nature that dominated musical culture, but also a return to mythology and historical tales from Danish culture. An increased number of composers began to work with folk mythology, and began to place great importance on including dramatic narratives based on Danish folk melodies (Tollå, 2019: 1, 19). Johnsson (1965: 1) concurs, saying that:

Music in Denmark grew up for the first time during the Romantic era to be a real expression of the national tone and Romantic musical feeling. ... During the so-called Golden Age, composers like Niels Wilhelm Gade, Johan Peter Emelius Hartman and Peter Heise built up a national style with typical harmonic and melodic features inspired from folk-tune.

Most importantly, it was the use of the folk melody which gained importance during this time, often not an exact replica of the folk-tune itself, but rather using melodic and rhythmic ideas

as inspiration (Tollål, 2019: 20). Fog further highlights the importance of song, both in the traditional form of folksongs, as well as in expressing socio-political influences in nationalistic music. He writes:

Considerable importance is attached to music as the most powerful medium of that day. We can see that in the songs; if you had a message to further, a song was very efficient. This we can follow from the Marseillaise through political ballads, national songs during struggle for liberation or constitution up to songs of socialism or temperance, and in later years of women's liberation, peace movements etc. The song remains a mighty medium. (Fog, 1985: 35)

It can be seen that compositional trends mirrored the socio-political movements during this time. The struggle with national identity and a strong Germanic infiltration had a definitive impact on music. It would seem that the music composed during this time was not "indigenously" Danish, however, over time these styles became recognised, received, and perceived as the nationalistic music of Denmark. Tollål highlights that Danish music of the 19th century was based on the perceptions of traditional Danish concepts that were aligned with Danish ideals. Brincker and Leoussi (2018: 322) concur, highlighting that Denmark had no pronounced national musical traditions in the 19th century and that musical life in Denmark was strongly influenced by continental European composers and musicians. Tim Howell accurately sums it up by writing "There is a strong image, but a far weaker sense of identity" (Howell, 2019: preface).

As highlighted in this section, political movements in 19th century Denmark played an active role in shaping musical and compositional output. Through the increased interest in nationalistic structures Danish music gained popularity within greater Europe. Although more Germanic influences and the strophic song¹⁰ had previously been introduced, the movement towards Danish ideologies, as well as the renewed interest in nationalistic folk tunes, became more characteristic of the Nordic sound. J.P.E. Hartmann and Gade both expressed these nationalistic ideals in their music, and the literature highlights the inherent Nordic tone that persists within their compositional output. Therefore, Section 3.3.3. will attempt to verbalise this sonic quality in order to highlight the Nordic tone within Emil Hartmann's piano trio op. 10.

¹⁰ A strophic song, often applied to folk song, is a set of melodic, rhythmic and structural parameters of a composition which are repeated in succession. Every strophic song — insofar as there is more than one verse — is made up of similarly arranged sections (stanzas) that can be sung to the same melody (Holý, 2013: 133).

4.3.2. Nationalism and the Nordic tone

Howell explains that the term Nordic refers to Denmark, Finland, Iceland, Norway and Sweden. Although often geographically grouped together, Howell highlights that in a cultural sense each of these countries have differing cultural, human and social structures (Howell, 2019: xvi). Despite their differences, they seem to display a common sonic characteristic which seems unique to the geographical space that they occupy.

Robert Schumann (1810–1856), was the first to identify the “Nordic tone” in the compositions of Niels W. Gade by labelling Gade’s music as inherently “Nordic” in nature (Howell, 2019: xvi). According to Fjeldsøe and Groth in Howell (2019), this realisation of Nordicism within Gade’s compositions was due to ideologies about the North (Nord meaning North) which persisted in Germanic society. A specific attraction to “The North” had already been instilled in Germanic society through philosophy and academia, as well as the increased interest in nationalistic music (Fjeldsøe and Groth in Howell, 2019: 5).

Gade’s Nordic connection that Schumann identified was his use of folk-like song in his compositions. Gade’s incorporation of these folk-like themes was recognised as a nationalistic gesture, and thus strengthened the perception of the idea of Nordic quality in his compositions. In one of his compositions, he claimed to have drawn inspiration from the songs of ancient giants, which harbour strong connections to the mythological character of folk music. The embodiment of this was perceived sonically as the “Nordic tone” which roots itself in the model which constitutes the compositional build-up of a folk lied. Audibly, it is perceived by the “dark misty tone” which is influenced by Nordic myths and legends (Fjeldsøe and Groth in Howell, 2019: 5).

Complications around the discussion of a “Nordic tone” arise with the difficulty of pinpointing a specific set of rules or guidelines to aid in identifying and describing this atmosphere. As mentioned in Chapter 3, many composers from the Nordic countries studied in major mainland European centres, resulting in the influence of the Germanic-Romantic style filtering into their musical compositions (Fjeldsøe and Groth in Howell, 2019: 5). With this Germanic influence, finding the inherent Nordic sound becomes increasingly difficult. Krabbe (2005) mentions that it is an interesting paradox that Danish composers in the 19th century were most popular outside their Nordic borders and were in these instances specifically

labelled as Nordic composers. He exclaims that this classification of “Nordic” does not emanate solely from the nature of the music itself, but also from a combination of compositional style, as well as the audience’s reception of the music. (2005: 118).

4.3.3. Identifying the Nordic tone

Torvinen and Välimäki describe Nordic music to be reminiscent of Nordic environmental imagery, stating that these composers have various ways of depicting such imagery using structural tropes, intertextuality, allusion and sensitivity to induce the ambient nature of the music (Torvinen and Välimäki in Howell, 2019: 173).

Grainger (in Harris, 2000: 27) describes the characteristics of Nordic melodies as follows:

Solemn or spiritual unadorned melodies with long sustained notes or at least clearly defined intervals, gapped scales and a marked tendency to some kind or other of underlying harmonic or polyphonic thot [sic].

More descriptions from Grainger’s writings include: melodies that are characterised by “long sustained notes and phrases which induce concentration”, “inventive non-repetitive melody [that] leads the mind of the listener on to inquisitive or scientific wonder”, and “irregularity of intervals, rhythms, bar-groupings, phrases and harmonies [which] attunes our minds to the unfortunate knowableness of nature” (Harris, 2000: 27).

Torvinen and Välimäki identify the Nordic sound to be similar to the “pastoral”¹¹ quality that has been used by many composers within music history, creating a spatial, natural and environmental aesthetic within the sound (Torvinen and Välimäki in Howell, 2019: 173). This aesthetic is induced through compositional techniques such as static musical textures which may consist of drones, pedal points, open intervals, simple harmonic structures, steady pulse, peaceful atmosphere, repetitive motifs, hushed muted sounds, dark timbres and closed form (Torvinen and Välimäki in Howell, 2019: 173–174).

¹¹ A literary, dramatic or musical genre that depicts the characters and scenes of rural life or is expressive of its atmosphere. The term has been used in musical titles as both an adjective (Beethoven’s Pastoral Symphony) and a noun ([César] Franck’s Pastoral) and may be used both ways in referring to the type in general (Chew and Jander, 2001).

4.4. Conclusion

Chapter 4 explored the complicated history of Denmark's musical life in the 19th century and highlights the nationalistic ideologies and tropes which were infiltrated by a strong Germanic presence. However, the literature also presents an inherent Nordic presence within the compositional structure of Danish compositions which is identified in the compositions of both Hartmann's contemporaries, J.P.E. Hartmann and Niels W. Gade. Chapter 5 seeks to place Emil Hartmann amongst his contemporaries within 19th century Denmark, whilst exploring his use of Nordic compositional qualities within the trio, op. 10.

Chapter 5: Locating the Nordic tone in op. 10

To locate the Nordic quality in Hartmann's piano trio op. 10, this chapter will use a method of music-theoretical analysis to dissect the trio. As is evident in the previous chapter, the Nordic tone has been a common sonic presence throughout the oeuvre of Danish music. The purpose of this chapter is to trace the compositional techniques which characterise the musical representation of this Nordic tone whilst seeking the similarities of this in Hartmann's piano trio op. 10. As a means of placing him within this compositional era, two main analytical methods were consulted to formulate this analysis, as described below. The analysis will focus on two central aspects, folk influence and musical stasis, which create the Nordic quality in the music. With this in mind, Torvinen and Välimäki state that "musical reality is more complex, and rarely does a single composition fit into only one category" (in Howell, 2019: 176).

One analyst of Nordic music was the Australian-born Percy Grainger (1882–1961). As outlined earlier in the text, Amanda Harris (2000) focuses on Grainger's observations on Nordic music. Grainger was a composer, pianist and analyst who was highly influenced by Nordic compositional elements. He was a well-respected composer, and arguably the most well-known Australian composer within the Western Art Music canon. Despite his contribution to Western art music, he also harboured many problematic and controversial beliefs. While Grainger was highly influenced by the Nordic traditions, he was also of the belief that the Nordic race was superior to any other. Harris explains that many researchers and academics have addressed the racial controversies within his writing, however none have provided an analysis of the Nordic influence within his compositions (Harris, 2000: 21). While not dismissing the racialism, supremacism and the radical views that Grainger held, Harris's paper provides an analytical framework for identifying Nordicism in music, based on Grainger's series of lectures titled *Nordic Characteristics in Music*, in 1921. In these lectures, Grainger outlines various Nordic compositional trends as well as ways to identify them.

Alongside Harris's interpretation of Grainger's analyses, Fjeldsøe and Groth and Torvinen and Välimäki's (in Howell, 2019) analytical frameworks discuss compositional tropes which can be used to induce the Nordic tone within a composition. Drawing on their approach to analysing various Nordic compositions, an analytical method could be applied to identify the Nordic aesthetic in the trio. These frameworks will highlight the use of folk-influence and musical

stasis within the trio op. 10 in order to root the composition within 19th century Denmark. Moulton (2005) uses a descriptive analysis to highlight the influence of folk-tales through the representation of the influence of Bards within compositions. I use his framework alongside the above-mentioned authors to highlight this in Hartmann's piano trio.

5.1. Folk influence

The opening theme of Hartmann's trio (see Example 1) returns at various points throughout the work, for example at the beginning of the 4th movement (see Example 2). Fjeldsøe and Groth say that the arpeggiated figures are reminiscent of bards¹² striking their harps, which they highlight as being strongly associated with the Nordic tone (Fjeldsøe and Groth in Howell, 2019: 5). A similar recognition of this is highlighted by the composer Robert Schumann, who commented on Gade's *Overture: Reminiscences of Ossian*, op. 1, as follows:

N. W. Gade has been brought up by the poets of his fatherland; he knows and loves all of them. During the walking tours of his childhood, he was accompanied by the old tales and legends, and from the shores of England the gigantic harp of Ossian¹³ reached his ears. Thus, in his music, not least in his *Ossian Overture*, we see for the first time a specific, pronounced Nordic characteristic. (Krabbe, 2005: 118)

The relevance of the harp-like figures within the music bear a strong resemblance to the act of telling a tale, like a bard strumming his harp. The harp figures act as indicators of commentary, narration, introductory motifs or musical events. Most importantly, Moulton highlights that Gade's use of this technique was exclusively connected to the primary theme throughout any particular composition, and would be used each time this theme reoccurred. He explains that this represents the bard's telling of an epic tale (Moulton, 2005: 61). In Example 1, Hartmann employs a similar technique of harp-like gestures mentioned by Fjeldsøe and Groth (in Howell) and Moulton. In the opening bars Hartmann uses the piano to play a sequence of rolled chords underneath the opening theme (Example 1) which is

¹² A tribal poet-singer skilled in composing and reciting verses on heroes and their deeds.

¹³ The ancient Gaelic-speaking people of Ireland and Scotland shared a common body of tradition. They both had bards who sang the tales of heroes, while accompanying themselves on a small harp. Ossian was such a bard. He lived in 3rd century Ireland and was, along with one of his nephews, the last survivor of his tribe (Okun, 1967: 327).

reiterated in the 4th movement (Example 2), where, similarly to Gade, the opening theme is repeated.

Emil Hartmann Op.10.

Poco Andante.

VIOLINO.

VIOLONCELLO.

Piano forte.

~~*

Example 1 [video file 00:17]: Hartmann, Piano Trio op. 10, 1st mov., page 3 (rolled chords in opening theme)

FINALE.

Poco Andante.

VIOLINO.

VIOLONCELLO.

Piano forte.

~~*

Example 2 [video file 08:02]: Hartmann, Piano Trio op. 10, 4th mov., page 31 (reoccurring opening theme)

Harris (2000) mentions that commonly Nordic folk-song singers would alternate between major and minor thirds, as well as major and minor sevenths. Although these intervals are not uncommon in Western Music, it is apparent that Hartmann's theme (see Example 3) is inundated with minor third intervallic movements. In the second bar Hartmann writes the cello line moving from a B-flat to a D-flat at the start of the bar, and continues to move from an F to an A-flat at the climax of the musical contour. He then lands back on the F (3rd bar) with a passing G-flat in between. Despite the fact that this could be coincidental rather than intentional, it is my opinion that this movement has been specifically highlighted as it appears at such an important climatic point within the melody line. Following the theme into the second system, Hartmann uses this technique repetitively, each time highlighting a climatic or rhythmical centre. Following on from this introductory section in the minor mode, Hartmann continues to use the same intervallic melodic movement once the second theme appears within the major key. This can be seen in Example 3 in the 3rd bar (D–F) and the 7th bar (E-flat–G) where the theme is reintroduced.

The melodic and harmonic structure of the composition in Example 3 are logical and tonal, highlighting the simplicity and timelessness of the folk lied as described by Tollå (2019). Hartmann uses the melodic material to make a gradual 'up and down' contour within the musical line. He uses short musical phrases which end with supportive cadential harmonic structures beneath. This strongly reiterates Tollå's suggestion that simplicity and uncomplicated harmonic movements were important aspects of the folk-tune model. Fjeldsøe and Groth concur, mentioning that a simple and logical movement within the melody is a common characteristic of a Nordic melody, and gives the impression of familiarity to the listener (Fjeldsøe and Groth in Howell, 2019: 17). Using Nielsen's composition *Nordika* as an example, Fjeldsøe and Groth highlight the simplicity in the composition, saying:

Another characteristic is the way the melody continues from the first bar in a simple, logical movement, giving you the feeling that you know this tune already, and the harmonies are quite subtle, almost passing by unnoticed. (Fjeldsøe and Groth in Howell, 2019: 17)

Similarly, in Example 3 Hartmann employs this technique by using the B-flat throughout the two lines in the example. Initially introduced by the cello in the first two bars, the piano

overlaps and begins to employ the B-flat in the bass note of each chord. This use of the B-flat is used to blur the harmonic changes, and alongside the arpeggiated feature employed by the right-hand acts as a way to pass through the harmonic changes drawing minimal attention to the changes in harmony. As is the case with Nielsen, Hartmann uses a simple melodic line above these subtle harmonic changes.

The image displays a page of musical notation for Hartmann's Piano Trio op. 10, 1st movement, page 4. The score is written in B-flat major and 3/4 time. It consists of three systems of staves. The first system includes a vocal line (marked 'Arco' and 'p dolce e cantabile') and piano accompaniment. The second system shows the piano accompaniment with a 'pp' dynamic. The third system includes 'riten.' markings. A double bar line with a star symbol is present in the second system.

Example 3 [video file 01:55]: Hartmann, Piano Trio op. 10, 1st mov., page 4 (blurred harmonic changes)

Daniel Grimley states that it is a common occurrence to find the presence of horn calls within Nordic compositions. He explains that horn calls are signifiers of opening and closing gestures and provide the music with an ambiguous sense of opening as well as closing (Grimley, 2001: 129). Horn calls can be represented as melodic and harmonic motifs of open fifths. Grimley explains that these horn calls provide the music with a circulation and sense of cohesion. In Nielsen's work *Genrebilleder*, Grimley analyses the horn fifths and describes that the music moves forward in a consistent use of chords I to V, making use of open fifth melodic patterns

and chordal melodic structures (Grimley, 2001: 129). He highlights that Nielsen makes use of the I to V chordal structure that was mentioned earlier. This is done with a static tonic pedal point which is then introduced with a triadic entry of the vocal line (Grimley, 2001: 129). Grimley goes on to say that Nielsen makes use of a motionless first bar, with swinging 4th and 5th horn calls which then introduce the start of the triadic (1–3–5–6) vocal line (Grimley, 2001: 129).

In Example 4 Hartmann uses a similar approach. In the Scherzo, Hartmann begins on chord V which he continues to use for 4 bars before gliding downward into a diminuendo which introduces the main theme. Although different in character to the work of Nielsen, Hartmann creates a sense of motionlessness by the use of an elongated chord V – similar to the static tonic pedal employed by Nielsen – which eventually descends into the main theme. Hartmann also introduces this with swinging 4th motivic riffs in the violin and cello voices during this introductory section. Drawing on the techniques mentioned above, in the *pianissimo* (*pp*) bar, Hartmann begins a series of chordal changes between chords I–V, repeatedly. Similarly, he introduces a triadic theme in the violin line above the repeated I–V chord progression, also referencing the techniques used by Nielsen. Similar motifs reappear throughout the movement, with the violin, cello and piano parts constantly interchanging. In the Scherzo Hartmann uses a steady, even flowing melodic line usually in 6/8 meter which is also characteristically Danish (Fjeldsøe and Groth in Howell, 2019: 6).

Example 5 [video file 04:56]: Hartmann, Piano Trio op. 10, 3rd mov., page 24 (direct fifth interval and tonic pedal point)

Howell makes the reader aware of a common motif which takes place within Nordic compositions, explaining that representation of a Nordic idea can often be found in the climatic points within a composition. He states that at the commencement of the climatic point a Nordic quality could come from the shift into a major mode, thereafter building to a climax, and during the descending passage towards the starting point, a folk-like twist can occur (Fjeldsøe and Groth in Howell, 2019: 17) In Example 6 Hartmann follows a similar structure, by shifting from a diminished chord in the penultimate bar and transitioning back into the tonic key, E-flat major (figure E in Example 6), to anticipate the climax of the movement.

Example 6: Hartmann, Piano Trio op. 10, 3rd mov., page 24 (transition into major key)

Although Hartmann creates an elongated ascent towards the climactic material, he eventually reaches the climax in bar 1 of Example 7, where he then makes a small folk-like twist upon his descent towards the closing section. In both Examples 5 and 6 Hartmann uses the piano in an arpeggiated manner to accompany the climatic melodic material displayed by the violin and cello. These fast arpeggiated passages can be interpreted to reference the harp-like passages mentioned above, and highlighting a presence of folk influence.

The image displays a musical score for Example 7, consisting of four staves. The top two staves are for the violin and cello, and the bottom two are for the piano. The piano part features a fast, arpeggiated accompaniment. The violin and cello parts show a melodic line that ascends to a climax and then descends. A box labeled "Folk-like twist" with two blue arrows points to a specific section of the descending melodic line in both the violin and cello parts. The score includes the instruction "sempre crescendo" on the first and second staves.

Example 7: Hartmann, Piano Trio op. 10, 3rd mov., page 24 (folk-like twist)

Example 9 highlights a similar situation where Hartmann uses the folk-like twist upon the descent of a climactic passage. This passage starts at figure D in Example 8, where Hartmann transitions from G minor, the tonic key of the Scherzo, into E-flat major in the third bar. He then continues building tension until he reaches the penultimate bar (Example 9) before figure E (in Example 10) where the violin plays an ornamental folk-like twist during the descent of the climax of the line, thereafter descending back into the tonic in the second bar of figure E. Again, Hartmann uses fast arpeggiated accompaniment passages which strengthen the argument of the folk-like influence in the trio.

Example 8 [video file 03:48]: Hartmann, Piano Trio op. 10, 2nd mov., page 19 (transition into major key)

Example 9 [video file 04:15]: Hartmann, Piano Trio op. 10, 2nd mov., page 19 (folk-like twist)

Example 10 [video file 04:20]: Hartmann, Piano Trio op. 10, 2nd mov., page 20 (transition back to tonic)

Rhythmically, Grainger points out that the nature of Nordic compositions relies strongly on irregular barrings and rhythmical figures through the compositions, making use of frequently

changing time signatures, rhythmical figures and juxtapositions of rhythmic figures (Harris, 2011: 23). Moulton concurs, stating that these rhythmical and time signature changes demonstrate juxtapositions of violence and love, peace and turmoil, and victory and defeat. Moulton describes this:

In Zelter's relatively short piece, for example, five contrasting themes occur, demarcated by tempo changes varying from *Lento* to *Allegro*. The opening section is marked *lento ma con moto*. Sixty-eight measures later the meter changes from triple to duple meter and the tempo increases to *Allegretto*, but this section lasts only eight measures and is followed by a change back to triple meter and a tempo marking of *Andante*. This *Andante* section concludes seventy-two measures later with a brief eight measures marked *Allegro*, followed by a change in meter to 6/8 and a tempo of *Andantino*. This juxtaposition of contrasting meters, tempos, and themes continues throughout the remainder of the piece. This variety mimics the oscillations of the *Ossian* poetry itself. These sudden contrasts may also imitate the improvisatory process of storytelling. (Moulton, 2005: 63)

Similarly, Hartmann makes use of frequently changing time signatures within the trio. In the 1st movement the introduction begins in a 3/4 introductory waltz, which flows into a simple 4/4 meter after only 30 measures. Again, the 4th movement is introduced by a 3/4-time signature which comes to a gradual end before the mood changes into a quick 2/4 rapid section. While in my opinion these transitions are not irregular aspects of 19th century compositions, these interchanging tempi cause the character of the sections to change, which creates a sense of introduction, body and end, similar to a telling of a story.

Lastly, Moulton refers to the use of framed form, and explains that this form is representative of the act of a narrative structure. He implies that the narrative structure of this form resonates with the imagery of the bard, and his storytelling. Moulton states that the repetitive nature of the returning themes represents echoes of past tales (Moulton, 2005: 64). Hartmann's piano trio presents a large number of similar examples. Firstly, Hartmann uses this technique within the microcosm of a single movement. Referring back to Example 3, Hartmann, through the violin line, introduces the main theme in measure 3. This theme is repeated in the CODA section and is whispered in conversation between the violin and cello in anticipation for the finale of the movement. Hartmann also utilises this technique on a larger scale by using the introductory waltz theme in Example 1 which he reintroduces in the

finale (4th movement) of the trio. This repetition is immediately recognisable to the listener, and along with the separated chords, resembles the storytelling of the Bard. Moulton also states that the slow introduction, in combination with the succession of the slow rolled chords portray an “out-of-the-mist image that sets an atmosphere for storytelling and evokes the act of remembering” (Moulton, 2005: 65).

5.2. Static musical textures

Musical stasis is a common characteristic of Nordic music. Torvinen and Välimäki write that static musical textures form a large part of the inherent Nordic quality found in Hartmann’s compositions. This musical stasis is also known as the Nordic drone. The drone is an important term when discussing compositions from Nordic countries, as it is an overarching inherent sonic quality which can be heard within these compositions and gives them their unique timbre. What is meant by stasis (static musical textures) is “all such musical principles or devices that highlight stasis instead of change” (Torvinen and Välimäki in Howell, 2019: 176). These terms can be referred to as “pedal points, ostinato figures, sound-sheets, long-lasting clusters and so on” (Torvinen and Välimäki in Howell, 2019: 176). Torvinen and Välimäki explain that these compositional techniques are employed to create the dark, barren and misty timbre that is so often heard within the music of Nordic composers. He believes that the influence for this tonal language comes from imagery within the Nordic environment, and the use of static textures help to induce this atmosphere (Torvinen and Välimäki in Howell, 2019: 173).

Torvinen and Välimäki in Howell (2019) give four main functions of static musical textures:

- i Static musical textures turn our attention to ‘nature in us’: to the listening body and its material processes. Music that foregrounds static elements, and in which changes (if there are any) come very slowly, shifts the listeners attention from a teleological conception of music as information and onward movement to music as occupying a space and environment; listeners become more aware of their corporeal existence, as well as of the physical environment in which they are listening...
- ii Musical stasis creates feelings of nostalgia and/or apocalypse. Leonard G. Ratner points out that pedal points have two main functions in eighteenth-century music: those on the tonic emphasize closure and statement, and a pedal point on the dominant represents a drive towards closure...In the context of music and nature, both these forms of pedal points have a clear nostalgic character...

- iii A pedal point is a common musical practice for representing nature (as in the topics of pastoral, sicilienne and harmony of spheres) ... as well as within various other cultures, for depicting other-than-human nature: real, mythical or imagined...
- iv Static textures highlight the experiential homology between Nordic music and the northerly natural environment. Arguably, there is a 'northern tone' that characterizes the music of the Nordic countries...As part of this tone, pedal points, and other static textures in Nordic music can be considered experientially homologous with respect to the northerly environment (Torvinen and Välimäki in Howell, 2019: 176-177).

Hartmann's piano trio contains ample use of pedal points and other forms of staticity within the various sections and movements. Below are highlights of these techniques where they feature most prominently throughout the trio.

In Example 11 Hartmann creates a misty atmosphere, by using the cello voice to play an elongated four-bar "D" between the second and fifth bars of the line. This creates a pedal point on the fifth degree of the scale, demonstrating a dominant pedal point. Here Hartmann uses a changing chordal harmonic structure in the piano part, eventually resolving to the tonic. This technique is characteristic of spatial elements mentioned in the framework above. With the dominant pedal point, the changing harmonic chordal structure played by the pedal causes a slight dissonance in the sonic quality of the phrase. Hartmann accentuates this with the sparsity of the stringed instruments, and by using the sustain pedal of the piano across these changing chordal structures to create a misty atmosphere.

The image shows a musical score for a piano trio. The top staff is for the cello, and the bottom two staves are for the piano. A blue bracket above the cello staff spans four measures, with a label 'Dominant pedal point' above it. The piano part features a series of chords, with a blue arrow pointing to the first chord and a label 'Changing chords' below it. The piano part starts with a forte (f) dynamic and ends with a piano (p) dynamic. The piano part includes a triplet of eighth notes in the final measure.

Example 11: Hartmann, Piano Trio op. 10, 1st mov., page 8 (pedal point with environmental influence)

In Example 12 Hartmann uses the *con fuoco* passage with a disguised pedal point in the third bar. While changing the quality of the chords in the piano, he maintains the dominant of the key (F major) which causes tension and anticipation. The cello and violin parts are rigorously moving forward with ostinato triplet patterns, and Hartmann eventually resolves this line to a dramatic closing page which resolves on the tonic. As mentioned in point two of Torvinen and Välimäki's classifications above, this is characteristic of a dominant pedal point emphasising closure. In fact, it is perhaps Hartmann's use of the pedal point, *con fuoco*, as well as the *fff* performance direction which all contribute to this as an indication of the dramatic closing statement.

The image shows a musical score for a piano trio. It consists of three staves: a treble clef staff at the top, a bass clef staff in the middle, and a grand staff (treble and bass clefs) at the bottom. The top two staves are marked with *fff con fuoco*. The bottom staff is also marked with *fff con fuoco*. The music features a dominant pedal point in the bass line of the piano part, which is highlighted with a blue bracket and labeled "Dominant pedal point". The score includes various musical notations such as triplets, slurs, and dynamic markings. The page number "3325" is visible at the bottom of the score.

Example 12: Hartmann, Piano Trio op. 10, 1st mov., page 14 (pedal point indicating closure)

In the *Andante* (see Example 13), Hartmann employs a dominant pedal point, which combined with the syncopated movement of the middle voice of the piano and simplistic melody above, creates a sense of knowing and belonging. In the second bar Hartmann writes a dominant seventh into the harmonic structure. This, along with the slow movement of the accompaniment, creates a sparsity which is reminiscent of a pastoral aesthetic.



3325

Example 13 [video file 05:42]: Hartmann, Piano Trio op. 10, 3rd mov., page 24 (pedal point indicating sparsity and pastoral quality)

Lastly, in example 14, Hartmann uses a pedal point at figure G within the image of a tremolo on the dominant. This quivering stylistic technique, along with the hurried contrasting semiquavers in the violin and piano part, create a sense of thunder and darkness. It is here that Hartmann is creating an environmental aesthetic that he was familiar with from his native Denmark.



Example 14: Hartmann, Piano Trio op. 10, 3rd mov., page 21 (pedal point indicating environmental)

5.2. Conclusion

Chapter 5 makes use of musical analysis in order to highlight specific instances of Danish musical influence in Hartmann's trio in question. It concludes that he makes use of folk-tune

models which are highlighted through his use of melodic, harmonic and rhythmic structures. Torvinen and Välimäki's framework (in Howell, 2019) has provided insight into musical stasis through the use of pedal point structures, which emphasises the Danish aesthetic found in op. 10. These analytical findings have been crucial in adding a final layer to the contextual process, placing Emil Hartmann within 19th century Denmark, as well as creating a layer of understanding of the discussed composition.

PART 3:

Reflection

Chapter 6: Discussion, Recommendations and Conclusion

Part 2 (Chapters 3, 4, and 5) above represents the different layers I explored in order to create a narrative of Emil Hartmann's piano trio, op. 10. The aim of this research is to reflect on the process of creating a narrative and how contextualisation adds depth to music-making and understanding. Through this study I have generated two sets of insights:

- Knowledge and contextual understanding generated through the narrative process; and
- A deeper understanding of the process of narrative generation, which speaks to the overarching aim of the research.

In this chapter I will reflect on the *process* of creating a narrative as part of contextualising a musical artefact for performance. As a conclusion of the process I will weave together the three methodological approaches outlined in Part 2, and use this to inform a discussion on context and interpretational choices in Emil Hartmann's piano trio, op. 10.

6.2. Reflecting on the process

The crux of this paper lies in the *importance* of the process of contextualisation. As the problem area used an under-researched composer within a lesser-explored historical narrative as the lens through which this research was undertaken, the nature of the process consulted a layered approach as a means of constructing this narrative. Using the musical artefact as the primary source in the research, each methodological tool was used to create layers of the narrative being created. The layered approach utilised each framework as a building block to generate the insights found above. Below I will highlight the integral part each framework played in this process of building Hartmann's narrative.

6.2.1. Practice-based research

Initially I began this research absent of knowledge about the work being performed and therefore decided to place the PBR section (Chapter 3) of this paper at the start, prior to further contextual explorations. The nature of this method serves as a dual purpose, namely:

- To explore the performers' initial connection with the artefact and creative process, in this case without any contextual framing; and
- Through the responses and musical experience of the performers, coupled with the historical contextualisation, to form research insights as part of the narrative building.

The questionnaire in Addendum A sought to draw out specific themes and insights from the performers based on their personal perspectives of engaging with the musical artefact. Through analysis and discussion of the results of the questionnaire, the research highlights that data drawn from the participants was thin. This is due to the lack of contextual information that the participants had available on Hartmann and the trio, op. 10.

On one hand this highlighted the need for a contextualisation process to take place, in order to gain a deeper understanding of a musical work. On the other hand, the themes used in the analysis of the questionnaires provided useful observations which could be applied to the formation of the narrative, creating a sense of direction for the historical exploration to take. Using the responses to interrogate the micro-context and theoretical analysis, the PBR was effective in weaving a narrative through this micro-history, adding a layer of understanding to Hartmann's narrative. From a research perspective, having an intimate knowledge of the score after learning and performing the trio provided me with a depth of knowledge which enabled me to tackle the analysis section with more depth and rigour. This section also gave a musical voice to the composition through the participatory nature of a musical exploration of learning and performing the work.

6.2.2. Micro-history

The micro-historical section (Chapter 4) of this paper follows the PBR chapter, helping to locate the replies within a historical context. At the same time this section provides valuable

insights into Hartmann's life and works and forms a direction for the analytical process that follows. Most importantly, Chapter 4 forms a bridge between the outer frameworks, providing a strong contextual understanding of the composition.

The intention of micro-history leans towards a lesser-explored historical narrative, which was an interesting undertaking of discovery in this research. Through the exploration of Emil Hartmann, other under-explored micro-narratives surfaced and highlighted issues surrounding the overarching historical grand narrative of mainland European cultural dominance in Denmark. As a result of this, a large part of the research made use of source material which did not directly refer to the topic in question. Therefore, in order to construct this narrative, socio-political sources were consulted, as well material on composers during Hartmann's time. This part of the contextualising process highlighted that most scholarship that exists surrounding Danish music largely focuses on scholarship written on Carl Nielsen, and therefore emphasises the need for further research to be conducted on Denmark's unexplored musical narrative.

6.2.3. Musical analysis

The musical analysis added a substantial layer of depth to the research, solidifying Hartmann's musical identity as a Nordic composer. The analysis further highlighted the possibility for contextualisation when approaching a composition, especially in conjunction with the historical context. Again, this section utilised various sources and their related methods to uncover different compositional themes, and concurrently highlighted the lack of historical and analytical scholarship in Nordic music. Locating the inherent Nordicism in Hartmann's composition became an act of creating a micro-analysis, similar to the historical underpinnings that surround the research.

6.3. Weaving the narrative

This hybridity of methodologies presented an interesting and innovative opportunity to create an interpretative understanding of an unexplored composition. Building the process from first playing the work and reflecting on it, to interrogating the socio-political and

personal history surrounding the composer, and finally analysing the composition itself, led to new insights in interpretational decisions. Such a process of constructing a multi-dimensional understanding attempts to weave together an authentic micro-history of Emil Hartmann, as a largely overlooked composer, and share a small contribution to his life and work.

The research in this paper points towards a complicated history of musical identity, highlighting a dominant mainland European, and in particular German, influence. What was strikingly apparent in researching Danish music is that Carl Nielsen (1865–1931) was a dominant figure throughout the era, so much so that he appears as a figurehead for Danish Western Art music. The extensive amount of research on him and his music seems to cast a shadow over the active musical lives of other Danish composers at the time. As alluded to in Chapter 4, Tollå explains that Danish compositions of the 19th century used Danish folk-tunes as a common motif within the music. The controversy surrounding the Danish folk-tune, and the influence of Johann Schulz's infiltration into Danish musical culture, questions the originality of the folk-tunes used, and points towards a dominant Germanic influence. Although this points to the complexity of not knowing how Danish some of the folk-tunes referred to were, Hartmann's composition nevertheless musically echoes these folk-tunes. His grandfather Johann Ernest Hartmann, father J.P.E. Hartmann, and brother-in-law Niels W. Gade were active musical figures within his family, and their Nordic influence would have filtered into his compositional style. In Chapter 4 his travels to study in centres such as Berlin, Dresden, Leipzig, Paris and Vienna within mainland Europe are briefly mentioned and imply that he would have been exposed to Germanic compositional trends. This juxtaposition of both Nordic and Germanic influences of the time are present in the composition as commented on by the performers in Chapter 3.

Aside from the debate about the originality of the Danish folk-tune, Tollå (2019) explains that these folk-tunes were based on dramatic Danish narratives from folklore and heroic tales. These sentiments were realised in the Hartmann trio by the violinist, who likened the trio's connection to tales of the tragic hero within literature and music, as stated above. The observations of the practitioners, as well as the research, indicate a strong Germanic influence in this piano trio. Both players have equated similarities between the composition and its contemporaries in Europe as containing similar musical characteristics. Both the observations of the players and the research indicate that Hartmann was strongly influenced

by European ideals and points to the reason why, although the string players have had minimal to no contact with the music of Denmark, their relationship to the music felt familiar. The familiarity that all three players described in the music align with Tollå's descriptions of what constitutes the German folk song, namely recognisable harmonic progressions, popular simple melodies and repetitive melodic and rhythmic content. This characteristic also relates to Torvinen and Välimäki's indication of the pastoral pedal point technique, which is used to create a feeling of knowing and belonging (in Howell, 2019).

The prominent European influence discussed above does not exclude the influence of the various Nordic elements. Relating the research to the creative process, it is apparent that there are elements recognised by the performers which align with the characteristics that have been described in the analysis section of the paper (Chapter 5). Torvinen and Välimäki describe the Nordic tone as sonically "dark and misty" (in Howell, 2019: 51) which can be related to the "brooding" quality (in Howell, 2019: 26) that the violinist identified. The previous analysis of the Nordic tone makes ample connection to the observations made in this creative process. The violinist's observation of the shifting harmonic major-minor quality can be identified in Fjeldsøe and Groth's analysis of dissecting the Nordic quality in the music. In Chapter 5, the harmonic major to minor shifts followed by a small folk-like twist can be seen as inherently Nordic in compositional character (Fjeldsøe and Groth in Howell, 2019).

Reflecting on Hartmann's use of effects within the trio, I noticed that his common use of the rolled chord could be inspired by the musical imagery of Bards striking their harps, as discussed in Chapter 5. The use of pedal points throughout the trio is a prominent stylistic trend of the Nordic influence, also highlighted in Chapter 5. In addition, Hartmann's composition makes use of the four pedal point techniques identified by Torvinen and Välimäki (in Howell, 2019). With reference to the effects mentioned in my personal creative reflection in Chapter 3, I highlighted the arpeggiated glissando (Extract F) which closely relates to the pedal point technique used to create a spatial and elongated atmosphere. Here Hartmann also employs a dominant pedal point, while using other mechanical and technical (as mentioned above) aspects to create a misty character. Another common occurrence is his use of tremolo, which, as an effect I immediately related to a natural phenomenon. His use of the pedal point in Example E closely relates to Howell's indication of the pedal point as a compositional technique which characterises the environmental conditions within Denmark.

6.4. Interpretational recommendations

As this trio is so closely related to European compositional ideals that are a prominent part of Western Art Music education, I was able to successfully portray this work to an audience. The quality of the compositional writing by Hartmann, as well as his highly Romantic style of writing, allowed all three musicians to connect with the music immediately. As the work is saturated with simple harmonic structures, lyrical melodies, effects and is highly Romantic, it was accessible for the audience who had a very positive reaction to the work. With expert musicians taking part in this project, their contribution to the success of the performance was due to their embodied knowledge, musicality, and experience with other music they have encountered in their musical endeavours. Although I was happy with the outcome of the performance, and what we were able to produce without any form of contextualisation, this project has opened an array of possibilities which I would suggest and implement when next engaging with this trio, or any other works composed by Hartmann. Most importantly, the research encouraged me to embrace the Nordic qualities which are presented in the work.

6.4.1. Pedal points

My initial feeling towards the trio was to approach it with clarity and dexterity. The score (ed. Stich & Druck) indicated an excess use of pedal, often suggesting that the sustain pedal be used through fast moving passages (see Extract H). With a previous understanding of the often untrustworthiness of edited scores, I was hesitant to follow that directive. As the passages were fast, fluid, and moving I chose to rather focus on clarity than risk any smudging of sound and harmonies. Another way I actively decided to clarify my playing was to constantly balance my chord to the upper note, so as to bring out the melodic material which I thought was the most important aspect of the music (refer to Example 11 in Section 5.2). My decision initially was again to balance the chords to the upper note, and try to stand out as the soloist in this section. Here Hartmann has written a sequence of chords over an elongated pedal point introduced by the cello.



Extract H [Video file 02:40]: Hartmann, Piano Trio, op. 10, 1st mov., page 5 (pedal indication for rapid triplet motif in piano voice at figure C)

After conducting this research, it has shed light on the importance of this inherently Nordic misty atmosphere within the music, and after re-consulting with post-contextual exploration, I realised that these sections were often underpinned with pedal point structures, which are part of the mystical character rather than editorial unreliability. When reflecting through this research and referring to Torvinen and Välimäki's indications (in Howell, 2019) of the atmospheric pedal point, I found that these sections could be approached in a manner which creates effect, rather than places importance on lyricism and clarity.

6.4.2. The tremolos

This composition is saturated with tremolo passages (highlighted in Example 14 in Chapter 5) which persist throughout most movements. During the creative process, as well as during the performance, I found these tremolos extremely difficult to execute, and especially to keep them at a controlled dynamic. The research has indicated to me that these tremolo passages could have been influenced by the Danish environmental surrounds. My interpretation of these now is that they represent the rumbling of thunder, and therefore complement this idea of the dark, misty sound that has been touched upon throughout this thesis. In future, I would reconsider my approach to these tremolos, and swell their dynamics over the period of the passage in order to create a more authentic representation of this feeling, which could aid in improving the technical comfortability of these bars.

6.4.3. Rubato

The approach to the trio initially was predominantly metronomic and structured. As the work was already written in such a Romantic style, I made the decision to follow my feeling of highlighting the clarity and dexterity of the work and maintaining a consistent sense of movement. As Hartmann often uses varying tempi within a singular movement, I also felt that I did not need to add tempo changes to the parts where they were not indicated. Reflecting on this, I have completely altered my view. In future endeavours with Hartmann's work I will experiment with long rubati and phrases, highlighting the space and breath within the music. Hartmann has written many lyrical lines throughout the trio, punctuated with mood changes in each movement. I now believe that I should have indulged in these euphoric moments and highlighted the changing moods and Romantic melodies that he incorporated in the work.

6.5. Conclusion

The process of constructing Hartmann's narrative has been an enriching and fulfilling experience. Most importantly, through the process of the methodological framework, the research has been able to give a voice to a narrative lost within the historical void. Reflecting back on the methods of data collection undertaken in this study, I am reminded of the Bards' act of storytelling and the metaphorical use of framed form within Nordic compositions, which highlight the narrational character of the telling of a tale. In a sense, this research has resonated with the framed form that Moulton described, by utilising the methodological process to form this narrative, thus providing closure to the study by bringing back the discoveries in Chapter 6. In essence, the method of constructing Hartmann's narrative through this process is reminiscent of the "out-of-the-mist image that sets an atmosphere for storytelling" as referenced in Chapter 5 (Moulton, 2005: 65).

Aside from the PBR section working in conjunction with the micro-historical and analytical frameworks, the reflections of the performers on Hartmann's piano trio have also provided a perspective for future performers to use this work in their own capacities. Highlighting the accessibility and beauty of the trio, both string players provide a wonderful conclusion to the creative process of the performing trio. Both participants remarked that they were very glad to be part of the process of presenting this trio, of which they were previously unaware.

Mouton (2020) reflected that the parts for all three instruments were equally challenging, which is not always the case in all trios and added to the mastery of the composition and the enjoyment for the performers. In agreement, Hofmeyr (2020) highlighted that she was surprised this work is not better known as she regards it as better than the Chopin trio and equally as good as the Schumann and Mendelssohn trios in relation to compositional complexity, technical requirements for all instruments and emotional depth. As a result of this multi-methodological framework, the research has forged a pathway which provided a means to bring Hartmann and his trio op. 10 into the academic and practical realm, despite a lack of initial scholarly material.

Prior to the contextualisation, the performers used their embodied knowledge alongside the score to perform the trio op. 10, and subsequently managed to relay a successful interpretation of the work to the audience. Although the initial performance proved to be successful, the research has highlighted an array of knowledge which could have added to the contextual understanding of the work and composer. As a result, I am of the opinion that it is indeed possible to play a fulfilling concert without having an in-depth knowledge of a composer's life or context, however, understanding the deeper narrative from which a work is created adds layers of meaning and nuance to a performer's relation to the music. There is a certain magic to relating a composition to a historical, geographical and personal narrative, which also pays homage to the composer as individual and artist.

References

Adorno, T. and Paddison, M., 1982. On the problem of musical analysis. *Music Analysis*, 1(2), 169-187.

Appuhn, K., 2020. *Microhistory*. Encyclopedia.com. [online] Available at: <<https://www.encyclopedia.com/international/encyclopedias-almanacs-transcripts-and-maps/microhistory>> [Accessed 22 January 2021].

Aylesworth, G., 2015. Postmodernism. In: E.N. Zalta (Ed.), *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Spring 2015 Edition). Stanford: Stanford University Library of Congress. Available at <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2015/entries/postmodernism/>.

Barrett, E. and Bolt, B. eds., 2007. *Creative Arts Enquiry* (pp.30-31). New York: I.B.Tauris & Co Ltd.

Brincker, B. and Leoussi, A.S., 2018. Anthony D. Smith and the role of art, architecture and music in the growth of modern nations: A comparative study of national parliaments and classical music in Britain and Denmark. *Nations and Nationalism*, 24(2), 312–326.

Cambridge University Press. (2019). Music in Context. [online] Available at: <<https://www.cambridge.org/core/series/music-in-context/C13B6AA8685EF7C6B85DF0D3AF954247>>[Accessed 9 August 2019].

Candy, L. and Edmonds, E., 2018. Practice-based research in the creative arts foundations and futures from the front line. *Leonardo*, 51(1), 66–67.

Candy, L., 2006. Practice based research: A guide. *CCS report*, 1(2), 1-19..

Chew, G. and Jander, O., 2001. Pastoral. In: *Grove Music Online*. [online] Oxford: Oxford Music Online. Available at: <<https://doi.org/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.40091>> [Accessed 9 October 2020].

Clayton, M., Herbert, T. and Middleton, R. eds., 2003. *The cultural study of music: A critical introduction*. New York: Routledge.

Dalhaus, C., 1983. *Foundations of music history* (p.5). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Day, D., 2020. Review of *J. P. E. Hartmann: Thematic-bibliographic catalogue of his works* by Inger Sørensen. *Notes*, 76(4), 619–620. [online] Available at:

<<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/757430/summary>> [Accessed 3 March 2021].

Dreyfus, L., 2020. Beyond the interpretation of music. *Journal of Musicological Research*, 39(2-3), 3–6.

Feld, S., 1984. Communication, music, and speech about music. *Yearbook for Traditional Music*, 16, 1–18. [online] Available at: <<https://www.jstor.org/stable/768199>> [Accessed 20 January 2021].

Fog, D., 1985. Music in the 19th century — A bibliographic project realized. *Fontes Artis Musicae*, 32(1), pp.33-35. [online] Available at: <<https://www.jstor.org/stable/23505831>> [Accessed 8 August 2020].

France, J., n.d. *Harmonious Families Volume 1 Danish Compositions by Fathers and Sons*. Classical Music Web. [online] Available at: <<http://www.musicweb-international.com/classrev/2001/Sept01/Hartmann.htm>> [Accessed 25 September 2020].

Grimley, D., 2001. Horn calls and flattened sevenths: Nielsen and Danish musical style. In H. White and M. Murphy (Eds.), *Musical constructions of nationalism: Essays on the history and ideology of European musical culture 1800–1945* (pp.123–141.) Cork: Cork University Press.

Harris, A., 2000. The nature of Nordicism: Grainger’s ‘blue-gold-rosy-race’ and his music. *Musicology Australia*, 24(1), 19–48. [online] Available at:

<<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/08145857.2000.10415913>> [Accessed 22 September 2020].

Hartmann, E. n.d. *Piano trio op. 10*. Eds. Stich & Druck. Fr. Kistner, Leipzig. Music score.

Heller, G.N. and Wilson, B.D., 1982. Historical research in music education: A prolegomenon. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, 69(Winter), 1–20.

Herman, M., n.d. Scandinavian symphonies from the 19th century to the present. MusicWeb International [online]. Available at: <<http://www.musicweb-international.com>>

international.com/ntl_discogs/scandinavian_symphonies/Scandinavian_symphoniesLZ.pdf>
[Accessed 21 November 2020].

Hersey, A., 2016. Danish opera: An introduction. *Opera Journal*, 49(2), 3–19.

Hofmeyr, Z., 2020. Personal communication and questionnaire

Holý, D., 2013. The sung units of the folk song, their relations and significance: Summary. *Zpěvní jednotky lidové písně, jejich vztahy a význam*. 133–136.

Howell, T., 2019. *The nature of Nordic music*. New York: Routledge.

Johnsson, B., 1965. Contemporary Danish piano music. *Music Journal*, 23(4), p.1.

Koudal, J., 1993. Ethnomusicology and Folk Music Research in Denmark. *Yearbook for Traditional Music*, 25, 100–125. [online] Available at:
<<https://www.jstor.org/stable/768688>> [Accessed 9 August 2020].

Krabbe, N., 2005. The reception of Gade, Hartmann and Nielsen: three Danish classics, and the role of the scholarly edition. *Fontes Artis Musicae*, 52(2), 116–124. [online] Available at:
<<https://www.jstor.org/stable/23510381>> [Accessed 14 September 2020].

Leavy, P., 2020. *Method meets art: Arts-based research practice* (3rd ed., pp.4–23). New York: Guilford Publications.

Levy, J.M. 1995. Beginning–ending ambiguity: Consequences of performance choices. In J. Rink (Ed.), *The practice of performance: Studies in musical interpretation* (pp.150–199). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Lützhøft, J. Wolstad, K., (2010). [Liner notes]. In *Emil Hartmann: Nordic and German Songs* [CD-ROM]. Denmark: DANACORD.

Mackerness, E., 2013. *A social history of English music* (pp.6–7). Oxfordshire: Routledge.

Magnússon, S.G. and Szijártó, I.M., 2013. *What is microhistory? Theory and practice*. [ebook] Abingdon: Routledge. Available at:
<https://books.google.co.za/books?id=r4bu63fyG3kC&printsec=frontcover&source=gbs_ge_summary_r&cad=0#v=onepage&q&f=false> [Accessed 21 June 2020].

- Marxists.org. 2020. *Glossary of terms: Gr.* [online] Available at:
<<https://www.marxists.org/glossary/terms/g/r.htm>> [Accessed 30 June 2020].
- McLoskey, L.D., 1998. *Twentieth century Danish music: An annotated bibliography and research directory.* Westport: Greenwood Publishing Group.
- Meyer, L., 1996. *Style and music: Theory, history, and ideology* (1st ed., p.70). Chicago: Chicago University Press.
- Moulton, P., 2005. *Of bards and harps: the Influence of Ossian on musical style.* Masters thesis, Florida State University.
- Mouton, S., 2020. Personal communication and questionnaire.
- Naxos.com. n.d. *Emil Hartmann.* [online] Available at:
<https://www.naxos.com/person/Emil_Hartmann/27044.htm> [Accessed 22 January 2021].
- Nimkulrat, N., 2007. The role of documentation in practice-led research. *Journal of Research Practice*, 3(1), Article M6. [online] Available at:
<<http://jrp.icaap.org/index.php/jrp/article/view/58/83>> [Accessed 31 January 2021].
- Okun, H., 1967. Ossian in painting. *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes*, 30, 327–356.
- Polanka, S., 2009. *Encyclopedia.com.* [online] Core Scholar. Available at:
<https://corescholar.libraries.wright.edu/ul_pub/58> [Accessed 9 March 2021].
- Sim, Y., 2011. More than just a budget label: A history of Naxos. *Music Reference Services Quarterly*, 14(3), 89–108. [online] Available at:
<<<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/10588167.2011.596003?needAccess=true>>> [Accessed 3 March 2021].
- Smith, H. and Dean, R., 2009. *Practice-led research, research-led practice in the creative arts.* Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Stewart, J., 2015. *The cultural crisis of the Danish golden age: Heiberg, Martensen And Kierkegaard.* Denmark: Museum Tusulanum Press.

Stolp, M., 2012. Practice-based research in music: International perspectives, South African challenges. *South African Music Studies*, 32(1), p.80.

Swanwick, K., 2002. *Musical knowledge: Intuition, analysis and music education*. London: Routledge.

Thom, P., 2003. The interpretation of music in performance. *British Journal of Aesthetics*, 43(2), 113–135.

Tollål, A., 2019. *The construction of Danish national identity in Carl Nielsen's Maskarade (1906)*. Master's thesis, University of Oslo.

White, J., 1994. *Comprehensive musical analysis* (1st ed.). Maryland: Scarecrow Press Inc, pp.1-4.

Wyche, S., Sengers, P. and Grinter, R.E., 2006. *Historical analysis: Using the past to design the future*. In: P. Dourish and A. Friday (Eds.) *UbiComp 2006: Ubiquitous Computing*. UbiComp 2006. Lecture Notes in Computer Science, vol. 4206. Springer, Berlin, Heidelberg. https://doi.org/10.1007/11853565_3

Addendum A: Questionnaire for participants

No.	Question	Zanta Hofmeyr (Violin)	Susan Mouton (Cello)
1.	<p>Emil Hartmann (1836–1898) is a composer from Denmark. Have you played any other works by Danish composers before? If so, who?</p>	<p>No, never.</p>	<p>Yes, in my orchestral career, I have played works by Carl Nielsen.</p>
2.	<p>When considering other chamber works within this time period, do you think that Hartmann’s piano trio, op. 10, is a typical trio of this era? Please explain your answer.</p>	<p>Yes, I think it has the Romantic characteristics of the 19th century. The brooding emotional quality of the B-flat minor introduction changing to B-flat major in the Allegro is one example.</p>	<p>It is certainly very Romantic in character, which was typical of that time period.</p>
3.	<p>When learning and performing this trio, were there any noteworthy assumptions, realisations or observations regarding the style and genre of this work (e.g. sacred, cinematic etc.)? Please elaborate.</p>	<p>High Romanticism comes to mind. Also, in terms of the return of the 1st movement introduction’s theme which is so similar to the introduction of the 4th movement. It reminds me of the César Franck violin sonata which has similar returning themes and motives.</p>	<p>This trio is very listenable. From the first play-through, we all loved the music, which is not always the case when learning unfamiliar works. It was very enjoyable to play, and a pleasure to make music with such Romantic writing.</p>
4.	<p>From a technical viewpoint, did you feel that the composition was well written particularly for your instrument? Please elaborate.</p>	<p>I find it extremely well written for the violin. The fast passages fit into the “violin hand” quite organically.</p>	<p>The cello part is very cellistic, which leads me to assume that Hartmann was either a cellist, or had close contact with a cellist while composing this piece. It really does lie well on the cello, and the cello is given much of the thematic material.</p>

5.	Did you notice anything significant about the melodic material, phrasing and musical characteristics within the trio?	Each moment starts with an introduction. The string parts are very prominent in terms of melodic dominance with equal weight in the distribution of whoever is leading and a constant dialogue between the two string instruments. The piano is both dominant and supportive in terms of the melodic and accompaniment content of the part.	The string writing had bowings that really made sense, which again makes me believe that Hartmann must have been a string player, probably a cellist, based on the amount of times the cello actually introduced many of the themes.
6.	Did you feel that Hartmann's use of harmony was interesting or different when considering other Romantic works? Please elaborate.	I find it very similar to other Romantic works. There are a lot of references to the music of Mendelssohn and Schumann.	Definitely quite a few unusual harmonies – not what one would have expected – possibly the Danish influence.
7.	What were your thoughts on the form and structure of the trio?	It follows the established forms of sonata and chamber writings as developed especially by Beethoven and Mendelssohn in their piano trio works. The placement of the Scherzo before the slow movement (Andante) is similar to the Debussy trio in G major.	Quite typical 4 movement format, with a Scherzo as the 2 nd movement, and a beautiful slow movement as the 3 rd movement. The Finale re-introduces the opening theme from the 1 st movement, which ties them together.
8.	When playing a piece of music, there are always emotional triggers which we experience. Can you describe what emotional reaction you had towards the music? Some key aspects could include: key signatures, rhythmical motifs, melodic contours,	The broodiness of the introductions of the 1 st and 4 th movements definitely has an overarching imprint of the Romantic personality of the work. The tragic heroes come to mind i.e. <i>Cyrano de Bergerac</i> , <i>Winterreise</i> (Schubert) and even <i>Lieder eines fahrenden Gesellen</i> (Mahler) with the dreams and disappointments so intricately woven together, forming real moments of joy and also depths	I really loved playing this trio. Although it was technically quite challenging, the fact that one could really “get into” the music, emotionally, made it all worthwhile. The cello's first theme was definitely one of my favourite parts of the whole piece – and I think the audience could immediately relax and enjoy this, too.

	emotional responses and thematic material.	of despair which ultimately make up the sum total of life. All of that can best be expressed through music which can express the inexpressible.	
9.	When considering other trios from this era, do you think that the virtuosity, complexity and depth of Hartmann's trio compares equally to the works of his contemporaries? Please explain.	I do think it does compare equally. I am surprised that it hasn't become more well-known. It is so much better than the Chopin trio and equally as good as R. Schumann and Mendelssohn's trios – both in terms of compositional complexity, emotional depth and technical requirements for the performers.	Yes, I do. I think that all 3 of the instruments had a number of technical challenges, which makes it enjoyable for everyone involved. It is not always the case with all trios.
10.	Did the various movements have a sense of cohesion and flow? Please explain.	Yes, see descriptions in previous answers regarding themes and form.	Yes, again I must mention how the Finale begins by quoting the opening theme from the first movement. Also, the Andante of the 3 rd movement follows on really well after the frenetically fast Scherzo, which is the 2 nd movement. The keys of the various movements also make for variety as well as continuity.
11.	Do you have any general observations about the work and the composer?	I am delighted to have been asked to take part in the performance of this work. I would never otherwise have known about the Hartmann Trio op. 10. As an active performer myself, it showed me the importance of being open to explore lesser known works such as this. His father was apparently also very much influenced by Louis Spohr and I couldn't help but notice some of Spohr's composition style also evident in the violin part.	I am really thrilled to have been introduced to this piece, and would love to play it again. It seems a shame that he is not better known. I am very grateful to have been introduced to Emil Hartmann.

<p>12.</p>	<p>This project aims at looking at the musicological factors surrounding Hartmann's life, in order to gain greater understanding about his music. If you have knowledge of any literature, recording or composers that could be of assistance to this project please list it below.</p>	<p>See previous references to Debussy – Trio, Schubert – Lieder, Mendelssohn – piano trios, R. Schumann – piano trios, also violin sonatas, Spohr – violin concerti and duos for two violins, Mahler – <i>Lieder eines fahrenden Gesellen</i>.</p>	<p>Only because I was curious, I did look him up, and see that he has a number of compositions. Of particular interest to me would be his Cello Concerto in D minor, and his string quartets. This trio seems to have been his only piano trio, which is interesting for it was one of his earlier works.</p>
-------------------	--	--	---

Addendum B: Video File (Extracts and Examples)

QR Code: Extracts and Examples from performance of Emil Hartmann *Piano trio op. 10*



<https://mevie.love/94n0l2d7jkfc0m7h7ggjwflzb9uwijxoi6u0go01/?pw=>